

Minutes of the Meeting of the Council of the City of Sheffield held in the Town Hall, Sheffield, S1 2HH, on Wednesday 4 September 2013, at 2.00 pm, pursuant to notice duly given and Summonses duly served.

**PRESENT**

THE LORD MAYOR (Councillor Vickie Priestley)  
THE DEPUTY LORD MAYOR (Councillor Peter Rippon)

1	<i>Arbourthorne Ward</i> Julie Dore Jack Scott	10	<i>Dore &amp; Totley Ward</i> Keith Hill Joe Otten Colin Ross	19	<i>Mosborough Ward</i> David Barker Isobel Bowler Tony Downing
2	<i>Beauchief &amp; Greenhill Ward</i> Simon Clement-Jones Roy Munn Clive Skelton	11	<i>East Ecclesfield Ward</i> Garry Weatherall Steve Wilson Joyce Wright	20	<i>Nether Edge Ward</i> Nikki Bond Anders Hanson Qurban Hussain
3	<i>Beighton Ward</i> Helen Mirfin-Boukouris Chris Rosling-Josephs Ian Saunders	12	<i>Ecclesall Ward</i> Penny Baker Roger Davison	21	<i>Richmond Ward</i> John Campbell Martin Lawton Lynn Rooney
4	<i>Birley Ward</i> Denise Fox Bryan Lodge Karen McGowan	13	<i>Firth Park Ward</i> Sheila Constance Alan Law Chris Weldon	22	<i>Shiregreen &amp; Brightside Ward</i> Peter Price Sioned-Mair Richards Peter Rippon
5	<i>Broomhill Ward</i> Jayne Dunn Shaffaq Mohammed Stuart Wattam	14	<i>Fulwood Ward</i> Sue Alston Andrew Sangar Cliff Woodcraft	23	<i>Southey Ward</i> Leigh Bramall Gill Furniss
6	<i>Burngreave Ward</i> Jackie Drayton Ibrar Hussain Talib Hussain	15	<i>Gleadless Valley Ward</i> Steve Jones Cate McDonald Tim Rippon	24	<i>Stannington Ward</i> David Baker Katie Condliffe Vickie Priestley
7	<i>Central Ward</i> Jillian Creasy Mohammad Maroof Robert Murphy	16	<i>Graves Park Ward</i> Ian Auckland Bob McCann Denise Reaney	25	<i>Stockbridge &amp; Upper Don Ward</i> Alison Brelsford Richard Crowther Philip Wood
8	<i>Crookes Ward</i> Sylvia Anginotti Rob Frost Geoff Smith	17	<i>Hillsborough Ward</i> Janet Bragg Bob Johnson George Lindars-Hammond	26	<i>Walkey Ward</i> Neale Gibson Nikki Sharpe
9	<i>Darnall Ward</i> Mazher Iqbal Mary Lea	18	<i>Manor Castle Ward</i> Jenny Armstrong Terry Fox Pat Midgley	27	<i>West Ecclesfield Ward</i> Trevor Bagshaw Adam Hurst Alf Meade
				28	<i>Woodhouse Ward</i> Mick Rooney Jackie Satur Ray Satur



**1. APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE**

Apologies for absence were received from Councillors Ben Curran Tony Damms, Harry Harpham, John Robson and Diana Stimely.

**2. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

There were no declarations of interest by Members of the Council.

**3. PUBLIC QUESTIONS AND PETITIONS AND OTHER COMMUNICATIONS**

**3.1 Communications**

Recording and Filming of Council Meetings

The Lord Mayor (Councillor Vickie Priestley) made a statement to Council concerning the recording and filming of Council meetings. She stated that the Council will be asked later at this meeting to approve changes to Procedure Rules within its Constitution to clarify the arrangements by which recording of the Authority's meetings will be facilitated under the direction of the Chairs of the meetings.

These changes will make it clear that photography, video and sound recording of the proceedings of meetings whilst open to the public shall be permitted under the direction of the Chair of the meeting and in accordance with any protocols and guidance issued by the Council's Monitoring Officer. The Chair has discretion to withdraw or suspend this permission should he or she deem it necessary, for example if the recording is disrupting the conduct of the meeting, or where a member of the public participating in a meeting objects to being recorded. In order to assist the Chair to manage the recording of the meeting, any member of the public wishing to record must inform the Chair and the recording must be clearly visible.

**3.2 Petitions**

(a) Petition Regarding the Former Public Convenience on Haggstones Road, Worrall

The Council received a petition containing 309 signatures and requesting action with regard to the former public convenience on Haggstones Road, Worrall.

Representations on behalf of the petitioners were made by Ray Battye. Mr Battye, Chairman of the Worrall Environmental Group, stated that the site of the former public conveniences on Haggstones Lane, Worrall, had been in a state of development since 2005 when the conveniences were demolished. Planning permission was granted for a shop in 2008 and building work began, and then stopped after 18 months. What was currently in place was a half completed construction, surrounded by metal fencing, which was unattractive and detracts

from the appearance of the Village. Despite assurances from the owner in September 2012, that building would recommence, no such work had taken place. The matter had been on the Environmental Group's agenda for a considerable time and the Group decided to organise the petition, which had been signed by about one quarter of the people in Worrall.

He stated that it was significant that, in July 2014, the route of the Tour de France would pass through Worrall and the images of this (at present) unattractive site could be broadcast across international media. There was an opportunity to help to make the site complete by the time of that event in 2014. The petition asked the Council to do whatever it could to ensure that the site was not detrimental to the well kempt village of Worrall and the wider area both during and after the Tour de France.

The Council referred the petition to Councillor Leigh Bramall, the Cabinet Member for Business, Skills and Development. Councillor Bramall stated that there were legal timescales for the completion of developments following the granting of planning permission. He said that he was delighted that the Tour de France would be coming to this area in 2014. He would examine the matters raised in the petition and would respond to the petitioners.

(b) Petition Objecting to Selective Licensing in the Page Hall and Fir Vale Area

The Council received a petition containing 725 signatures and objecting to selective licensing in the Page Hall and Fir Vale area.

On behalf of the petitioners, Ahsan Ashraf addressed the Council. He stated that the petitioners did not support the proposals for the introduction of selective licensing in the Page Hall and Fir Vale area. Such a scheme did not deal with the problems in the area which included anti-social behaviour and litter. It was proposed instead that existing legislation be more effectively enforced. People wanted immediate action, rather than waiting for a selective licensing scheme, which would take time to implement. Interim Management Orders were required to deal with anti-social behaviour and Empty Dwelling Management Orders should be issued to address the 134 empty properties, representing 6.7 per cent of properties which needed to be put back into use. The Council should also use existing powers to deal with overcrowding in some properties and to bring about more timely eviction of tenants, where appropriate.

Mr Ashraf referred to the introduction of a selective licensing scheme in Salford, which was not considered to have been effective as, for a cost of £240K it had addressed problems only in relation to a few bad landlords.

He referred to some positive examples of other local authorities, including Leicester and Lewisham, which had incentivised landlords to house good tenants in properties. He also made reference to alternative approaches and to the measures within Anti-Social Behaviour Crime and Policing Bill 2013.

Mr Ashraf stated that people did not want a selective licensing approach which adversely affected good landlords and tenants and which also led to an increase

in homelessness. He also expressed concern at the cost of consultation relating to selective licensing, which had so far cost £32K. He also made reference to fighting in a consultation meeting and tensions, which represented a problem with the way in which the consultation had been undertaken.

The Council referred the petition to Councillor Julie Dore, the Leader of the Council. Councillor Dore explained that Councillor Harry Harpham, the Cabinet Member for Homes and Neighbourhoods had given apologies for the meeting today and he would normally have responded to the petitioners on these matters.

Councillor Dore stated that she accepted that this was an emotive issue. She had not been involved directly with this particular consultation process, which was designed to bring out and respond to the type of issues that people had identified. She emphasised that Selective Licensing was only one option to respond to the range of problems which the petition had outlined. Other engagement meetings had also taken place with residents, tenants and landlords as part of the consultation process. All points of view, including those raised by the petition submitted at this meeting, would be collected and taken into account. It was clear that people wanted matters to be addressed.

The Council will also look at examples of best practice elsewhere and assessment of how effective this had been. Councillor Dore stated that a response would be made to the range of issues raised in the petition.

(c) Petition Objecting to the Threat of Library Closures in the Ecclesfield Parish

The Council received a petition containing 173 signatures and objecting to the threat of library closures in the Ecclesfield Parish.

On behalf of the petitioners, Vic Bowden addressed the Council and stated that most of the signatures to the petition had been those of people in the parish of Ecclesfield. She stated that people were angry at the prospect of losing Ecclesfield and Chapeltown Libraries. Libraries provided services which supported people's mental wellbeing. The petition asked the Council to continue to maintain library services, which was a question of priorities.

The Council referred the petition to Councillor Mazher Iqbal, the Cabinet Member for Communities and Inclusion. Councillor Iqbal made reference to the disproportionate level of Government funding cuts, the results of which the Council had to manage. Up to 14 libraries were at risk. Consultation had taken place in the summer of 2012 and a call for action had commenced in February 2013, and had been delayed because of the late announcement by the Government of the spending review. Whilst no decision had yet been made as regards proposals for libraries, these would be published within the next fortnight.

(d) Petition Requesting a Reduction in the Speed Limit Outside Ecclesfield Secondary School

The Council received a petition containing 411 signatures, requesting a reduction in the speed limit outside Ecclesfield Secondary School.

On behalf of the petitioners, Colin Taylor addressed the Council. He stated that each year, 3 pupils at Ecclesfield School were involved in road accidents. He had campaigned in relation to road safety in the area for some time and a crossing had been installed through the Northern Community Assembly. A recent fatality had led to a delay in the introduction of a speed limit until after the outcome of the inquest was known. He stated that he had asked Councillor Weatherall, previously the Chair of the Community Assembly, about the inclusion of a 30 mph speed limit in the Streets Ahead Programme and Councillor Joyce Wright had been quoted as saying that speed was a matter for the police.

Mr Taylor said that it was not appropriate to have a 40mph speed limit outside a school, and the speed limit should be reduced as a matter of urgency to protect the safety of young people. He commented that he was pleased that 20 mph limits were introduced elsewhere in the City.

The Council referred the petition to Councillor Leigh Bramall, the Cabinet Member for Business, Skills and Development. Councillor Bramall stated that the amount of investment in the enforcement of school zag-zag and school entrance schemes had doubled and 20 mph zones were being introduced in the City. He stated that Councillor Weatherall had discussed with him the issue of road safety at Ecclesall School and with a view to reducing the speed limit outside the School and in relation to work with the North Sheffield Youth Forum. A feasibility study had been carried out to examine a reduction in the speed limit and there was a good case for something to be done. Subject to affordability, the Council was looking to fund such a scheme.

(e) Petition Requesting Enforcement of the 20 mph Speed Limit in Shiregreen

The Council received a petition containing 60 signatures, requesting enforcement of the 20 mph speed limit in Shiregreen.

The Council referred the petition to Councillor Leigh Bramall, the Cabinet Member for Business, Skills and Development. Councillor Bramall stated that there was a 20 mph speed limit already in place in Shiregreen and he expected that enforcement of the speed limit was the actual matter of concern. A response in writing would be made to the petitioners.

### 3.3 Public Questions

(a) Public question concerning Government Austerity Programme

Geoffrey Turner made reference to the recent Fair Deal for Sheffield campaign and the Council's criticism of the Government's austerity policies and the effects of budget cuts on Sheffield. He asked whether the Council would support and publicise an anti-austerity event to be held on 14 September, hosted by the Sheffield People's Assembly; and would it encourage elected Members to attend.

In response, the Leader of the Council, Councillor Julie Dore, stated that she did support any challenge to the Government in respect of the cuts being made,

particularly in relation to Sheffield. She asked Mr Turner to let her have details of the event, to enable her to make sure it was in line with Council policy. A Council Motion had previously been passed in support of the Fair Deal for Sheffield campaign and she stated that she especially supported that part of the event on 14 September 2013 at which the Cabinet Member, Councillor Jack Scott was a speaker.

(b) Public Question concerning Benefits and the Residency Test

Mr B O'Malley stated that the Council needed to follow up with the Home Office, UK Border Agency and Housing Benefit Department to see who is entitled to move from one EU country to another and claim benefits. He referred to the habitual residence test for people wishing to reside in the UK and he made reference to the need for people to prove they could actively support themselves. In Page Hall, he stated, the application of the residency test was in question.

In response, Councillor, the Leader of the Council, Julie Dore, stated that she would ask the questioner to identify where this may be an issue and the Council would then follow it up.

(c) Public Questions Concerning Burning of Waste in Firvale and dumping of household waste in Page Hall

Leslie Miller stated that he was concerned about the burning of rubbish by people in Firvale and to fires which people were having during and night and day which produced toxic fumes and affected people living nearby and which he was concerned were dangerous.

Shaun Outram spoke concerning litter and the dumping of household items of rubbish in Page Hall. He stated that a big clean-up had taken place in Page Hall on 3 July and he commented that the Council and local people had done a brilliant job in clearing up the area. However, there were still some households who were dumping rubbish. Photographs of the situation had been passed to a local Councillor. He said that CCTV had been promised to help enforcement, although it was not yet installed. He stated it was like living in a landfill site.

In response to both questions, the Cabinet Member for Environment, Recycling and Streetscene, Councillor Jack Scott, stated that fires were permitted in people's backyards, so long as they did not cause a nuisance. The Council wanted to make sure that people disposed of waste properly. He also made reference to the successful week of action in July, which took place in Page Hall. The Council could not promise to reinstate weekly bin collections. However, Councillor Scott stated that he was especially concerned about dangers presented by fires and would like to arrange a meeting with City Councillors, and representatives from the South Yorkshire Police and the Fire and Rescue, to look at concerns in relation to safety and pollution and to make sure that people understood the risks relating to fire.

Councillor Scott said that he was pleased at the achievements during the week of action in Page Hall and the 120 local people who helped during the clean-up. He

agreed that the week of action was only a first step and community and education work would need to continue. Enforcement also needed to be increased and tougher action taken, where necessary. CCTV was to be installed next week and Councillor Scott apologised for the delay. Uniform and plain clothes officers were undertaking enforcement work. It was important to keep the community engagement work going and use intelligence from local people to assist enforcement so that the area could be kept clean.

(d) Public Question Concerning Labour Party Trade Union Funding

Christopher Bains made reference to the Labour Party's potential loss of funding from the GMB trade union and asked whether the Council agreed that the Leader of the Labour Party, Rt Hon Ed Milliband, had "shot himself in the foot" in relation to trades union funding.

In response, the Leader of the Council, Councillor Julie Dore, stated that she was not a member of the GMB but was a member of the Unite trades union and she was more than happy to be affiliated with the Labour Party as, she believed, it was the only political party which fought on behalf of decent hard working people.

(e) Public Question Concerning Safeguarding Children in Page Hall Area

Bernadette Biggin referred to toddlers and young children from the migrant community in the Page Hall area, who she was concerned had little clothing and were begging and asking for money and might be at risk of harm. She asked why social services had not become involved in the situation. She also made reference to safeguarding legislation which was designed to protect children and ensure that children were growing up in a safe environment, with the best outcomes and protected from harm. She asked what agencies were doing to safeguard these children.

In response, the Cabinet Member for Children, Young People and Families, Councillor Jackie Drayton, thanked Bernadette Biggin for her question and said that she appreciated her concern and that of residents of Page Hall.

The safeguarding of all our children is really important and was absolutely vital. The City Council was committed to ensuring that children and young people in the City achieve their full potential and are safe and healthy and it would do everything possible to protect them from harm.

Councillor Drayton said that there was a lot of general work going on in the Page Hall area by agencies, including Multi Agency Support Teams (MAST), specialist health visitors, the Missing from Education Team, Sheffield Futures and youth services, Police Community Support Services and South Yorkshire Police, the Pakistani Advice Association and local community workers.

Specifically, a parenting course was to be held at the Pakistani Advice Community Association to help parents to understand their responsibilities in relation to children and including road safety, safeguarding and food. The local authority had a statutory responsibility to investigate any child protection issues

that are reported and needed to obtain specific details and evidence, if social workers were to be asked to be involved. The information could be given anonymously and in confidence, either to workers at the Pakistani Advice Community Association or directly to the MAST team and, once that had happened, a social worker assessment of the family concerned could be undertaken and action could be taken to support the child.

(f) Public Question Concerning Section 30 Order in Page Hall

Jane Howarth referred to groups of youths and adults who were congregating in the Page Hall area, which she stated, caused people to feel intimidated at all times of the day. Older people especially were afraid to leave their houses. Members of the groups were believed to be under the influence of alcohol and nuisance behaviour included, urinating in public and dropping items of litter including cans and bottles. A Section 30 Order was in place in the area, but was ineffective at night and something also needed to be done during the daytime. She asked why the Police were not dispersing adults and youths in gangs of 20, 30 or more and stated that the curfew was not being enforced.

The Cabinet Member for Communities and Inclusion, Councillor Mazher Iqbal, responded that the Police were responsible for the enforcement of the Section 30 Order which was in place in the Page Hall area. Work was taking place with local councillors and Rt Hon David Blunkett MP. This was the second occasion on which a Section 30 Order has been introduced in the area. The Police and communities were meeting on 5<sup>th</sup> September in relation to the issues facing the area. People were invited to attend.

The police were not able to move people on if they are not committing anti-social behaviour. After 9.30pm, the Police did have powers to take young people home.

Councillor Iqbal said that he had walked around Fir Vale and in speaking to people in the area, had heard mixed messages concerning the effectiveness of the Section 30 Order. He requested that people report incidents to the 101 telephone number so that as much evidence and intelligence could be gathered as possible. He stated that he would speak with the police concerning the matters which had been raised and ask them to respond.

(g) Public Questions Concerning the Libraries Review

Thomas Barstow asked when would a copy be made available of the proposals from the Library Review, as originally promised on 20 July 2013 and which of the Council's Scrutiny Committees would consider this as part of its work programme?

Colin Taylor asked is there a secret list of threatened libraries that has been shared with parish councillors. He also referred to Councillor Mazher Iqbal stating on Radio Sheffield on 3 September, that he would let people know which libraries are under threat within the next two weeks. He asked, why cannot this be announced today, as others were obviously in the know.

The Cabinet Member for Communities, Councillor Mazher Iqbal, responded, that

the information concerning the Libraries Review would be made available within the next two weeks. The Council had made a commitment to provide a comprehensive, modern and affordable library service. The relevant Scrutiny Committee was the Economic and Environmental Wellbeing Scrutiny and Policy Development Committee and people would be informed if the matter was called-in for scrutiny. The issues facing libraries were not unique to Sheffield and some 200 libraries had been closed in the country. The funding for the Libraries service was affected by the cuts in Government funding to local authorities.

(h) Public Questions Concerning Bedroom Tax

Brian Hanson asked how people could be expected to pay the bedroom tax from the £102 that he had available each week, which was more than the amount some people received because he had a disability, on top of all other bills.

Gareth Lane stated that the Labour Party had promised to scrap the bedroom tax if it was elected to Government. He asked whether the City Council would pledge not to evict people who fell into arrears because of the bedroom tax.

Margaret Stone asked if the Council planned to monitor the effects on families of reductions to welfare benefits and the effect on services including those dealing with homelessness and malnutrition.

The Leader of the Council, Councillor Julie Dore responded by thanking Mr Hanson for a particularly passionate and emotive speech. She stated that the policy relating to the bedroom tax was a Government decision. As it was a national policy, there was little that the Council could do.

There were Government policies which also had a disproportionate effect on the most vulnerable people. These included changes which reduced tax credits, the increase in VAT, the removal of the Education Maintenance Allowance, a benefits cap and the rising cost of living. All of these things disproportionately affected the poorest and most vulnerable people. The City Council could not fill the gap left by these cuts and changes. Councillor Dore said that she was pleased that a future Labour government would repeal the legislation which introduced the bedroom tax and was the only party which would stand up for working people.

The Cabinet Member for Communities and Inclusion, Councillor Mazher Iqbal, stated that, in Sheffield, the working poor would lose £180 and the rising cost of living for those who worked would result in a shortfall in household income of £6,000 by 2016. The Council was monitoring the effect of welfare reforms and an officer group was established, working with advice services and the Credit Union on what can be done to mitigate the effects of welfare change.

A report concerning welfare reform had been considered by the Safer and Stronger Communities Scrutiny Committee and it had been agreed that future monitoring reports would be submitted to that Scrutiny Committee. The Scrutiny Chair, Councillor Chris Weldon, had agreed to write to the Deputy Prime Minister in relation to welfare reform.

Councillor Iqbal stated that the number of food banks was increasing and there was concern about payday loans, which was the subject of a Notice of Motion at this meeting of Council.

The Cabinet Member for Finance and Resources, Councillor Bryan Lodge stated that he would like to assure people that, with regard to arrears with Council Tax or the bedroom tax, the Council would not evict people, providing they had made arrangements with the service.

(i) Public Questions Concerning Selective Licensing

Wahid Nazir apologised for the behaviour of some of those people who attended a recent meeting concerning selective licensing which Councillor Mazher Iqbal also attended.

He referred to landlords in the University area of Sheffield, where the Council had raised similar concerns to those relating to the Page Hall area and where the 'Snug' scheme was introduced at a cost of £50 per property, and where properties were valued between £150K and £300K. He contrasted this with landlords in his own area of Page Hall, with properties at a value of £50K to £90K and where it was proposed to charge between £500 and £1,500 per property for a selective licence. Both proposals mention that landlords need to better manage their properties and tenancies and help reduce anti-social behaviour. He asked why this discrimination had occurred in relation to the proposals.

Ahsan Ashraf stated, in relation to selective licensing, that the costs of the license would be passed on to the tenants and this would make it more difficult for them to pay household bills.

Shafiq Uddin apologised to Councillor Iqbal in relation to the behaviour of some people who attended a meeting concerning selective licensing on 15 August.

He stated that for tenants from the European Union (EU) that arrive and are unable to provide a reference, they will not be able to live in a selective licence area. He stated that this would be a breach of the free movement of trade and labour EU Directive. He asked, how does the Council expect to deal with this issue?

The Leader of the Council, Councillor Julie Dore, responded that the Council was concerned and was looking at what happened at the meeting held on 15 August.

The purpose of the public consultation was to generate questions, responses and points of view in relation to proposals and look at alternatives. This was also evident by the points raised at the Council meeting today and at other engagement fora. Local Councillors were also involved in engagement activity and everyone had a responsibility to make sure that people demonstrated acceptable behaviour and to report incidents if appropriate.

The tenants, residents, landlords, Police and City Council all needed to make a commitment to address the range of issues present in the Page Hall area.

Selective licensing may not be the solution to these issues of concern and the purpose of consultation was to explore this further.

Councillor Mazher Iqbal, the Cabinet Member for Communities and Inclusion, in reference to the 15<sup>th</sup> August meeting, thanked Mr Nazir and Mr Uddin for their apology and their support.

(j) Public Questions Concerning Remploy

Peter Davies, GMB, asked if the Council would commit to making sure that all procurement and commissioning processes within the Council's influence included questions that clearly seek to establish what commitment partners have to the Council's goals, objectives and desires, especially as set out in Notice of Motion 14 at this meeting of Council.

Robert Carlson asked if the Council was aware that a businessman from Hull, Mr Gerard Toplass, Managing Director of Claughtons, had tried, unsuccessfully, to get Remploy and the Government to take another look at his bid to save Sheffield's Remploy factory. He asked what the Council could do to assist Mr Toplass.

James Stribley asked, given the Government's decision regarding Remploy, which had resulted in Remploy workers being made unemployed, did the Council agree that it is especially important that the Council seeks commitment from its partners to assist it in achieving its desire to secure employment and support for vulnerable workers.

In response, the Cabinet Member for Finance and Resources, Councillor Bryan Lodge, stated that he was not convinced by the case put forward in the decision to close the Remploy factory in Sheffield, particularly given the longer term considerations, including people's health, the opportunities for other employment and the cost of people claiming benefits. He wished those workers affected by the closure every success in finding alternative employment.

In relation to procurement, Councillor Lodge stated that, in connection to the commitment of partners, the wording suggested by Mr Stribley at the meeting of Council in July 2013 (relating to tender bids considering Remploy and Sharrow Industries vulnerable workers) was what the Council also wanted to incorporate into tender documents. He said that to help people into employment, it was important to gain the commitment of the Council's partners.

As regards the bid by Mr Toplass in relation to Remploy, Councillor Lodge stated that he had already spoken with the Director of Creative Sheffield in connection with Mr Toplass' bid back in August with regards to how the Council might support him. The long term effects of closing the Remploy factory needed to be considered. Clive Betts MP was interested and supportive of Remploy and Councillor Lodge stated that a statement was needed from the Department of Work and Pensions as to why it believed that the closure of the Remploy factory was the best value option.

(k) Public Questions Concerning Accountability, Sanctions and a Voluntary Community Group

Martin Brighton stated that, at the Council meeting in July, the question was raised about the accountability of elected Members whose flawed decisions are costing the taxpayer. Since then, he stated, there have been two more cases of failure to comply with the Freedom of Information Act. He said that this intransigence was costing the taxpayer many tens, if not hundreds of thousands of pounds and stated that surely, the Council leadership should intervene. He asked what intervention the Council Leader considers appropriate to prevent further unnecessary burdens upon the taxpayer.

Secondly, Mr Brighton stated that it is reasonable to assume that, where there is an agreement between the Council and voluntary community groups, both parties comply. If the voluntary community group does not comply, it is sanctioned. He asked what happens when the Council fails to comply?

Thirdly, Mr Brighton stated that it is a generally accepted principle that, if an appeal is made against a Council decision, then adverse actions such as sanctions are suspended until the outcome of the appeal. He asked: does this Council agree with/comply with this principle and can the Council please provide the policy documents and signpost the relevant procedures.

Fourthly, Mr Brighton stated that at full Council in July, the question was raised about Council policy when the Council makes untrue statements. He asked, should the Council impose sanctions based upon those untrue statements, is it not reasonable that the sanctions stop whilst the complaint about the untrue statements is investigated.

Finally, Mr Brighton asked the Council to please note that false and defamatory statements about a voluntary community group are being widely disseminated as part of a campaign to discredit that group among local peer groups, if not city-wide. He asked can there be any objection to that voluntary community group exercising its right of reply.

The Leader of the Council, Councillor Julie Dore, responded that in connection with the question concerning the Freedom of Information Act, she would require details of the elected Members concerned and the decision in relation to which they are alleged to have failed to comply under the Act.

Councillor Dore stated that, when the Council fails to comply with the terms of an agreement, there was a complaints procedure and people could make a complaint to the Local Government Ombudsman and to a Secretary of State. She asked Mr Brighton to let her have details of where he believed that the Council had failed to comply.

In relation to appeals, Councillor Dore stated that there would only be a suspension of sanctions depending on the outcome of the appeal. The relevant documents would depend on the subject matter of the appeal. Such appeals procedures included those relating to School Admissions and Planning decisions.

Councillor Dore stated that, if the Council takes a decision and someone believes it is on an untrue basis, then, until investigation, the imposition of that sanction is still in place.

The Cabinet Member for Communities and inclusion, Councillor Mazher Iqbal, stated that he was not aware of the matter to which Mr Brighton referred in his final question concerning statements about a voluntary group. He stated that there was a complaints procedure. Where the Council contracted with other organisations, there were a number of agreed principles.

(l) Public Question Concerning Broadcasting of Council Meetings

Nigel Slack made reference to the change to the Council's procedural rules to allow members of the public to routinely record Council meetings. However, he stated, it would also enable those of a mind to do so, to edit, distort and poke fun at those same Councillors and their views and that he did not believe that this is a substitute for the Council providing a proper, complete and unedited broadcasting of Council meetings. Without such coverage, he said, it will be difficult, time consuming and potentially expensive for the Council to counter such parodies or potentially libellous portrayals of the Council's business.

Mr Slack stated that there was evidence that costs for official webcasting of Council meetings are much reduced from previous estimates provided by the Council, possibly at zero cost, and asked will the Council therefore undertake to review their stance on the potential for webcasting Council meetings.

In response, the Leader of the Council, Councillor Julie Dore, stated that, the Council would have to look at the detail of providing webcasting of its meetings held in public at potentially zero cost. Quite often, she stated, something such as broadcasting or webcasting at 'no cost' might also involve an element of advertising or sponsorship.

(m) Public Question concerning Community Involvement Structures

Nigel Slack made reference to the new arrangements aimed at replacing the Community Assemblies. He stated that the ward meetings are to be the focus for community involvement and asked can Council explain why they are required to meet only once a year?

He stated that each ward is to have a lead Ward Councillor appointed by Full Council and asked where is the local democracy in this, suggesting that they should be chosen by the Ward's own Councillors and, if necessary, ratified by Council. He asked about the process at the Council meeting for filling the posts of Lead Ward Councillor.

In reference to the Chairs of the Local Area Partnerships, which Mr Slack said had already been chosen by the Full Council, he asked; where is the local democracy in this choice and suggested the lead Ward Councillors should choose who leads their Area.

Mr Slack stated that the report suggests that the wards may also hold 'up to' four additional meetings supported and resourced by the administrative team. He asked what happens if wards wish to meet more often than that?

With respect to the Local Area Partnerships, and in reference to the report, Mr Slack asked the following:

- Where are the public in this arrangement?
- Where is the arrangement for the less influential local partners (the public) to be assisted by Council officers?
- In relation to Local Area Partnership Meetings, why should the public be excluded from any of these meetings and those discussing key issues should be particularly open to transparent scrutiny.

In reference to consultation on the proposals and responses, Mr Slack stated that less than 43% of the respondents thought the proposals were a reasonable way forward and only 19% thought the proposals took account of the varying needs of Sheffield's residents and said that we can only conclude that the current proposals suit the Council but not the community they are supposed to serve. He asked, will the Council undertake to improve these plans as a matter of urgency to reverse the whittling away of the City's democratic structures?

In response, the Cabinet Member for Communities and Inclusion, Councillor Mazher Iqbal, stated that, as Mr Slack had submitted a number of detailed questions on the subject of locality working, he would provide to him written responses, subject to Mr Slack's agreement.

(Note: Mr Slack indicated that he agreed to this suggested approach.)

(n) Public Question Concerning Questions to Cabinet Members

Mr Slack had submitted a third written question concerning the process of asking of public questions and providing supporting information and he asked how the Council prioritises the different democratic structures within the Council's Constitution and which were considered dispensable in the current climate.

The Leader of the Council, Councillor Julie Dore, responded to the question by stating that usually, for example at Meetings of the Council's Cabinet, Mr Slack would be allowed a longer time to ask questions. There was not necessarily a priority order of democratic structures within the Constitution.

#### **4. MINUTES OF PREVIOUS COUNCIL MEETING**

The minutes of the meeting of the Council held on 3 July 2013 were approved as a correct record.

## 5. MEMBERS' QUESTIONS

### Urgent Business

There were no questions relating to urgent business under the provisions of Council Procedure Rule 16.6 (ii).

### Questions

A schedule of questions to Cabinet Members, submitted in accordance with Council Procedure Rule 16, and which contained written answers, was circulated and supplementary questions under the provisions of Council Procedure Rule 16.4 were asked and were answered by the appropriate Cabinet Members.

### South Yorkshire Joint Authorities

There were no questions relating to the discharge of the functions of the South Yorkshire Joint Authorities for Fire and Rescue, Integrated Transport, Pensions or Police under the provisions of Council Procedure Rule 16.6 (i).

## 6. CHANGES TO THE CONSTITUTION

**RESOLVED:** On the Motion of Councillor Pat Midgley, seconded by Councillor Penny Baker, that this Council:

- (a) approves the changes to the following Parts of the Constitution, as set out in the report of the Chief Executive now submitted, and its appendices:-
  - (i) Part 2 - Article 9
  - (ii) Part 3 – Responsibility for Functions
  - (iii) Part 4 – Council Procedure Rules
  - (iii) Part 4 - Access to Information Procedure Rules
  - (iv) Part 5 – Officers' Code of Conduct
  - (v) Part 5 - Guidance Note on General Procedures at Planning and Highways Committee
  - (vi) Part 5 - Protocols for the South Yorkshire Health Scrutiny Joint Committee and Yorkshire and Humber Councils Joint Health Scrutiny Committee
  - (vii) Part 7 – Management Structure and Proper Officers; and
- (b) notes the minor/consequential changes to the Constitution made by the Director of Legal and Governance, in consultation with the Lord Mayor, under delegated authority, outlined at paragraph 4 of the report.

**7. AUDIT COMMITTEE**

**7.1 Audit Committee Annual Report 2012/13**

The Council received and noted the Annual Report of the Audit Committee 2012/13. The Chair of the Audit Committee (Councillor Ray Satur) gave an introduction to the work of the Committee and expressed thanks to Members of the Audit Committee and the officers who supported the Committee.

**7.2 Audit Committee Independent Members' Term of Office**

**RESOLVED:** On the Motion of Councillor Pat Midgley, seconded by Councillor Penny Baker, that this Council approves the recommendation made by the Audit Committee at its meeting held on 9th July 2013 that the maximum term for the appointment of the co-opted members of the Audit Committee be increased to five years to allow for flexibility in the recruitment process, in accordance with the details outlined in the report of the Chief Executive now submitted.

**8. LORD MAYOR'S ANNUAL REPORT 2012/13**

Councillor John Campbell introduced the Lord Mayor's Annual report for the Municipal Year 2012/13.

Council noted the report of Councillor John Campbell reviewing his term of office as Lord Mayor during the Municipal Year 2012/13, now submitted, and referred the recommendations contained in the report for consideration by the Director of Legal and Governance.

**9. APPOINTMENT OF HONORARY RECORDER OF SHEFFIELD**

**RESOLVED:** On the Motion of Councillor Julie Dore, seconded by Councillor Shaffaq Mohammed, that this Council appoints His Honour Judge Julian Nicholas Goose QC to the position of Honorary Recorder for Sheffield with effect from 5th September 2013, in accordance with the details outlined in the report of the Chief Executive now submitted.

**10. MEMBERS' ALLOWANCES - LOCAL AREA PARTNERSHIP CHAIRS**

**RESOLVED:** On the Motion of Councillor Bryan Lodge, seconded by Councillor Mazher Iqbal, that this Council approves the recommendation made by the Cabinet at its meeting held on 17th July 2013, that the role of the Local Area Partnership Chair be established with a Special Responsibility Allowance included in the new Band C of Schedule 1 to its Members' Allowances Scheme, and that the payment of this allowance be backdated to 16th May 2013, in recognition that the Chairs had been operating in shadow form since that date,

as set out in the report of the Chief Executive now submitted.

(Note: Councillor Trevor Bagshaw voted against paragraph (c) of the recommendation of Cabinet to which the Motion above relates and asked for this to be recorded.)

## 11. REPRESENTATION, DELEGATED AUTHORITY AND RELATED ISSUES

**RESOLVED:** On the Motion of Councillor Pat Midgley, seconded by Councillor Gill Furniss, that (a) approval be given to the following changes to the memberships of Boards, etc:-

Licensing Committee	-	Councillor Joyce Wright to replace Councillor Phillip Wood
Economic and Environmental Wellbeing Scrutiny and Policy Development Committee	-	Councillor Ibrar Hussain to fill a vacancy
School Admissions Forum	-	Remove Councillor Talib Hussain to create a vacancy
Monitoring and Advisory Board	-	Councillor Mary Lea to replace Councillor Jenny Armstrong
East Area Housing Board	-	Councillor Sheila Constance to fill a vacancy
Local Action Partnership Chairs Group	-	Councillors Mazher Iqbal, Peter Price, Pat Midgley, Ray Satur, Neale Gibson, Garry Weatherall, Andrew Sangar and Steve Jones to fill vacancies
Locality Working – Lead Ward Councillors:-		
Arbourthorne	-	Councillor John Robson to fill a vacancy
Beauchief and Greenhill	-	Councillor Clive Skelton to fill a vacancy
Beighton	-	Councillor Ian Saunders to fill a vacancy
Birley	-	Councillor Karen McGowan to fill a vacancy
Broomhill	-	Councillor Jayne Dunn to fill a

		vacancy
Burngreave	-	Councillor Talib Hussain to fill a vacancy
Central	-	Councillor Robert Murphy to fill a vacancy
Crookes	-	Councillor Rob Frost to fill a vacancy
Darnall	-	Councillor Mary Lea to fill a vacancy
Dore and Totley	-	Councillor Colin Ross to fill a vacancy
East Ecclesfield	-	Councillor Garry Weatherall to fill a vacancy
Ecclesall	-	Councillor Diana Stimely to fill a vacancy
Firth Park	-	Councillor Chris Weldon to fill a vacancy
Fulwood	-	Councillor Andrew Sangar to fill a vacancy
Gleadless Valley	-	Councillor Steve Jones to fill a vacancy
Graves Park	-	Councillor Ian Auckland to fill a vacancy
Hillsborough	-	Councillor George Lindars-Hammond to fill a vacancy
Manor Castle	-	Councillor Pat Midgley to fill a vacancy
Mosborough	-	Councillor David Barker to fill a vacancy
Nether Edge	-	Councillor Nikki Bond to fill a vacancy
Richmond	-	Councillor Martin Lawton to fill a vacancy
Shiregreen and Brightside	-	Councillor Peter Price to fill a vacancy

Southey	-	Councillor Gill Furniss to fill a vacancy
Stannington	-	Councillor David Baker to fill a vacancy
Stocksbridge and Upper Don	-	Councillor Phillip Wood to fill a vacancy
Walkley	-	Councillor Neale Gibson to fill a vacancy
West Ecclesfield	-	Councillor Adam Hurst to fill a vacancy
Woodhouse	-	Councillor Ray Satur to fill a vacancy
Standards Committee Members	-	Councillors Talib Hussain and Peter Rippon to fill vacancies
	-	Councillors Ian Auckland and Colin Ross to fill vacancies
(b) representatives to other bodies be appointed, as follows:-		
Mental Health Partnership Board	-	Councillor Ben Curran to replace Councillor Clive Skelton
Duke of Edinburgh's Award Scheme – Sheffield Council	-	Councillor George Lindars-Hammond to replace Mr Alan Hooper
(c) it be noted that, under delegated powers, the Leader of the Council has appointed Councillors Jack Scott and Bryan Lodge to serve on the Emergency Planning Shared Services Joint Committee.		

(Note: Councillor Trevor Bagshaw abstained on the above Motion and asked for this to be recorded).

## **12. NOTICE OF MOTION GIVEN BY COUNCILLOR SHAFFAQ MOHAMMED**

### **Business Support**

It was moved by Councillor Shaffaq Mohammed, seconded by Councillor Ian Auckland, that this Council:-

(a) welcomes the redevelopment of The Moor, which was secured by the

previous Administration and is progressing at pace;

- (b) thanks the Government for its support in enabling St Pauls (Phase 3) to proceed, notably through the Growing Places Fund and the city-centre development deal;
- (c) contrasts these successes with the calamitous collapse of the Council's partnership over the Sevenstones New Retail Quarter, following months of dither and delay by the current Administration;
- (d) also notes with dismay the £62,000 taxpayer bill for the Council's disastrous attempt to fight a Next homestore planning application on appeal;
- (e) highlights the following comments as damning indictments of the Administration's business policy:
  - (i) Lord Wolfson, Chief Executive of Next - Sheffield City Council is "closing its doors for business";
  - (ii) Sheffield Chamber of Commerce - "Sheffield's going backwards"; and
  - (iii) South Yorkshire Federation of Small Businesses - Sheffield City Council has "lost touch with the business reality of the 21st Century";
- (f) believes progress at The Moor and St Pauls demonstrates that Sheffield is ripe for investment but regrets that the current Administration's rabid 'anti-business' attitude is damaging this potential;
- (g) furthermore, recalls the Administration's abject failure to manage the Council's capital budget and laments its staggering indifference to the damage this budget scandal has caused for jobs and businesses across Sheffield;
- (h) estimates that the current Administration's incompetence has cost the City thousands of new jobs;
- (i) calls upon the Chief Executive to instigate an immediate independent inquiry into the failure to deliver the city-centre new retail quarter; and
- (j) further, sincerely hopes that the farce over Next will not be repeated with the application for an Ikea superstore and calls upon the Administration to work closely with all partners to ensure this application is successful.

Whereupon, it was moved by Councillor Leigh Bramall, seconded by Councillor Chris Rosling-Josephs, as an amendment, that the Motion now submitted be amended by the deletion of all the words after the words "That this Council" and the substitution of the following words therefor:-

- (a) welcomes that the present Administration have made 'Business Friendly' and 'Focusing on Jobs' top priorities for the Council;
- (b) further welcomes the following programmes of the present Administration to support local businesses:-
  - (i) breaking down the barriers for Small Medium Enterprises (SMEs) to access the Regional Growth Fund;
  - (ii) the RISE Graduate Scheme which supports local SMEs employ graduates;
  - (iii) the export project supporting local SMEs in the export market;
  - (iv) the Sheffield Apprenticeship Programme;
  - (v) Skills Made Easy designed by Sheffield City Council, in partnership with the Local Enterprise Partnership (LEP), to put the purchasing power for training for the first time, in the hands of businesses in the Sheffield City Region (SCR);
  - (vi) Business Summits;
  - (vii) the small business loan fund;
  - (viii) up to 50% reductions in off street parking charges;
  - (ix) the Chapel Walk scheme;
  - (x) the Digital Direction Programme; and
  - (xi) securing a Start Up Loans for Young People, the only Council to have done so;
- (c) further welcomes the action of the present Administration of establishing the Keep Sheffield Working Fund, recognising the importance of supporting local businesses in the current challenging economic climate;
- (d) believes that this Administration's record sits in stark contrast to the record of the previous Administration, who did nothing to promote apprenticeships, and broke yet another promise to young people by secretly backtracking on a promise of its Leader to match the previous Government's investment in the Future Jobs Fund;
- (e) welcomes the successful development of the Moor under the present Administration, a project that had stalled under the previous Administration;
- (f) further welcomes plans announced last month for the new St Paul's office development around the Peace Gardens;
- (g) believes that the previous Administration sat back for three years and did nothing to progress the New Retail Quarter and believes that the main opposition group offer nothing more than empty words;
- (h) welcomes the decision to part company with Hammerson which will allow the project to move forward and notes that this has been supported by the Sheffield Chamber of Commerce;

- (i) further welcomes the action of the present Administration in securing the New Development Deal to inject funds into the retail quarter last November, prior to which the scheme was not viable and welcomes the work in the period since to redesign a new scheme that is viable in the current economic climate;
- (j) believes that the Administration is in a strong position to bring a high quality retail development to the Sheffield and resolves to continue to do everything it can to make this happen; and
- (k) regrets that the only anti-business rhetoric in the City comes from the main opposition group who continue to talk Sheffield down.

On being put to the vote the amendment was carried.

After a right of reply from Councillor Shaffaq Mohammed, the original Motion, as amended, was then put as a Substantive Motion in the following form and carried:-

**RESOLVED:** That this Council:-

- (a) welcomes that the present Administration have made 'Business Friendly' and 'Focusing on Jobs' top priorities for the Council;
- (b) further welcomes the following programmes of the present Administration to support local businesses:-
  - (i) breaking down the barriers for Small Medium Enterprises (SMEs) to access the Regional Growth Fund;
  - (ii) the RISE Graduate Scheme which supports local SMEs employ graduates;
  - (iii) the export project supporting local SMEs in the export market;
  - (iv) the Sheffield Apprenticeship Programme;
  - (v) Skills Made Easy designed by Sheffield City Council, in partnership with the Local Enterprise Partnership (LEP), to put the purchasing power for training for the first time, in the hands of businesses in the Sheffield City Region (SCR);
  - (vi) Business Summits;
  - (vii) the small business loan fund;
  - (viii) up to 50% reductions in off street parking charges;
  - (ix) the Chapel Walk scheme;
  - (x) the Digital Direction Programme; and
  - (xi) securing a Start Up Loans for Young People, the only Council to have done so;
- (c) further welcomes the action of the present Administration of establishing the Keep Sheffield Working Fund, recognising the importance of supporting local businesses in the current challenging economic climate;

- (d) believes that this Administration's record sits in stark contrast to the record of the previous Administration, who did nothing to promote apprenticeships, and broke yet another promise to young people by secretly backtracking on a promise of its Leader to match the previous Government's investment in the Future Jobs Fund;
- (e) welcomes the successful development of the Moor under the present Administration, a project that had stalled under the previous Administration;
- (f) further welcomes plans announced last month for the new St Paul's office development around the Peace Gardens;
- (g) believes that the previous Administration sat back for three years and did nothing to progress the New Retail Quarter and believes that the main opposition group offer nothing more than empty words;
- (h) welcomes the decision to part company with Hammerson which will allow the project to move forward and notes that this has been supported by the Sheffield Chamber of Commerce;
- (i) further welcomes the action of the present Administration in securing the New Development Deal to inject funds into the retail quarter last November, prior to which the scheme was not viable and welcomes the work in the period since to redesign a new scheme that is viable in the current economic climate;
- (j) believes that the Administration is in a strong position to bring a high quality retail development to Sheffield and resolves to continue to do everything it can to make this happen; and
- (k) regrets that the only anti-business rhetoric in the City comes from the main opposition group who continue to talk Sheffield down.

The votes on the Substantive Motion were ordered to be recorded and were as follows:-

For Paragraphs (a) (b) (c) - The Deputy Lord Mayor (Cllr Peter Rippon) and Councillors Julie Dore, Jack Scott, Roy Munn, Clive Skelton, Ian Saunders, Chris Rosling-Josephs, Helen Mirfin-Boukouris, Bryan Lodge, Denise Fox, Karen McGowan, Jayne Dunn, Stuart Wattam, Jackie Drayton, Ibrar Hussain, Talib Hussain, Mohammed Maroof, Robert Murphy and Jillian Creasy, Geoff Smith, Mary Lea, Mazher Iqbal, Joyce Wright, Steven Wilson, Garry Weatherall, Sheila Constance, Chris Weldon, Alan Law, Steve Jones, Tim Rippon, Cate McDonald, George Lindars-Hammond, Robert Johnson,

Janet Bragg, Pat Midgley, Jenny Armstrong, Terry Fox, Anthony Downing, David Barker, Isobel Bowler, Nikki Bond, Qurban Hussain, Lynn Rooney, John Campbell, Martin Lawton, Sioned-Mair Richards, Peter Price, Leigh Bramall, Gill Furniss, Richard Crowther, Philip Wood, Neale Gibson, Nikki Sharpe, Adam Hurst, Alf Meade, Jackie Satur, Mick Rooney and Ray Satur.

Against Paragraphs (a) (b) (c) and (e) (17) - Councillors Shaffaq Mohammed, Rob Frost, Sylvia Anginotti, Colin Ross, Joe Otten, Penny Baker, Roger Davison, Sue Alston, Andrew Sangar, Cliff Woodcraft, Denise Reaney, Ian Auckland, Bob McCann, Katie Condliffe, David Baker, Alison Brelsford and Trevor Bagshaw.

Abstained Paragraphs (a) (b) (c) and (e) (1) - The Lord Mayor (Cllr Vickie Priestley).

For Paragraphs(d) (g) (j) and (k) (56) - The Deputy Lord Mayor (Cllr Peter Rippon) and Councillors Julie Dore, Jack Scott, Roy Munn, Clive Skelton, Ian Saunders, Chris Rosling-Josephs, Helen Mirfin-Boukouris, Bryan Lodge, Denise Fox, Karen McGowan, Jayne Dunn, Stuart Wattam, Jackie Drayton, Ibrar Hussain, Talib Hussain, Mohammed Maroof, Geoff Smith, Mary Lea, Mazher Iqbal, Joyce Wright, Steven Wilson, Garry Weatherall, Sheila Constance, Chris Weldon, Alan Law, Steve Jones, Tim Rippon, Cate McDonald, George Lindars-Hammond, Robert Johnson, Janet Bragg, Pat Midgley, Jenny Armstrong, Terry Fox, Anthony Downing, David Barker, Isobel Bowler, Nikki Bond, Qurban Hussain, Lynn Rooney, John Campbell, Martin Lawton, Sioned-Mair Richards, Peter Price, Leigh Bramall, Gill Furniss, Richard Crowther, Philip Wood, Neale Gibson, Nikki Sharpe, Adam Hurst, Alf Meade, Jackie Satur, Mick Rooney and Ray Satur.

Against Paragraphs(d) (g) (j) and (k) (17) - Councillors Shaffaq Mohammed, Rob Frost, Sylvia Anginotti, Colin Ross, Joe Otten, Penny Baker, Roger Davison, Sue Alston, Andrew Sangar, Cliff Woodcraft, Denise Reaney, Ian Auckland, Bob McCann, Katie Condliffe, David Baker, Alison Brelsford and

Trevor Bagshaw.

- Abstained on Paragraphs(d) - The Lord Mayor (Cllr Vickie Priestley) and  
(g) (j) and (k) (3) Councillors Robert Murphy and Jillian Creasy.
- For Paragraph (f) (73) - The Deputy Lord Mayor (Cllr Peter Rippon)  
and Councillors Julie Dore, Jack Scott, Roy Munn, Clive Skelton, Ian Saunders, Chris Rosling-Josephs, Helen Mirfin-Boukouris, Bryan Lodge, Denise Fox, Karen McGowan, Jayne Dunn, Stuart Wattam, Shaffaq Mohammed, Jackie Drayton, Ibrar Hussain, Talib Hussain, Mohammed Maroof, Rob Frost, Geoff Smith, Sylvia Anginotti, Mary Lea, Mazher Iqbal, Colin Ross, Joe Otten, Joyce Wright, Steven Wilson, Garry Weatherall, Penny Baker, Roger Davison, Sheila Constance, Chris Weldon, Alan Law, Sur Alston, Andrew Sangar, Cliff Woodcraft, Steve Jones, Tim Rippon, Cate McDonald, Denise Reaney, Ian Auckland, Bob McCann, George Lindars-Hammond, Robert Johnson, Janet Bragg, Pat Midgley, Jenny Armstrong, Terry Fox, Anthony Downing, David Barker, Isobel Bowler, Nikki Bond, Qurban Hussain, Lynn Rooney, John Campbell, Martin Lawton, Sioned-Mair Richards, Peter Price, Leigh Bramall, Gill Furniss, Katie Condliffe, David Baker, Richard Crowther, Philip Wood, Alison Brelsford, Neale Gibson, Nikki Sharpe, Adam Hurst, Alf Meade, Trevor Bagshaw, Jackie Satur, Mick Rooney and Ray Satur.
- Against Paragraph (f) (2) - Councillors Robert Murphy and Jillian Creasy.
- Abstained on Paragraph (f) - The Lord Mayor (Cllr Vickie Priestley).  
(1)
- For Paragraph (h) (75) - The Deputy Lord Mayor (Cllr Peter Rippon)  
and Councillors Julie Dore, , Jack Scott, Roy Munn, Clive Skelton, Ian Saunders, Chris Rosling-Josephs, Helen Mirfin-Boukouris, Bryan Lodge, Denise Fox, Karen McGowan, Jayne Dunn, Stuart Wattam, Shaffaq Mohammed, Jackie Drayton, Ibrar Hussain, Talib Hussain, Robert Murphy, Jillian

Creasy, Mohammed Maroof, Rob Frost, Geoff Smith, Sylvia Anginotti, Mary Lea, Mazher Iqbal, Colin Ross, Joe Otten, Joyce Wright, Steven Wilson, Garry Weatherall, Penny Baker, Roger Davison, Sheila Constance, Chris Weldon, Alan Law, Sue Alston, Andrew Sangar, Cliff Woodcraft, Steve Jones, Tim Rippon, Cate McDonald, Denise Reaney, Ian Auckland, Bob McCann, George Lindars-Hammond, Robert Johnson, Janet Bragg, Pat Midgley, Jenny Armstrong, Terry Fox, Anthony Downing, David Barker, Isobel Bowler, Nikki Bond, Qurban Hussain, Lynn Rooney, John Campbell, Martin Lawton, Sioned-Mair Richards, Peter Price, Leigh Bramall, Gill Furniss, Katie Condliffe, David Baker, Richard Crowther, Philip Wood, Alison Brelsford, Neale Gibson, Nikki Sharpe, Adam Hurst, Alf Meade, Trevor Bagshaw, Jackie Satur, Mick Rooney and Ray Satur.

Against Paragraph (h) (0)

Nil.

Abstained on Paragraph (h) -  
(1)

The Lord Mayor (Cllr Vickie Priestley),

For Paragraph (i) (56)

The Deputy Lord Mayor (Cllr Peter Rippon) and Councillors Julie Dore, Jack Scott, Roy Munn, Clive Skelton, Ian Saunders, Chris Rosling-Josephs, Helen Mirfin-Boukouris, Bryan Lodge, Denise Fox, Karen McGowan, Jayne Dunn, Stuart Wattam, Jackie Drayton, Ibrar Hussain, Talib Hussain, Mohammed Maroof, Geoff Smith, Mary Lea, Mazher Iqbal, Joyce Wright, Steven Wilson, Garry Weatherall, Sheila Constance, Chris Weldon, Alan Law, Steve Jones, Tim Rippon, Cate McDonald, George Lindars-Hammond, Robert Johnson, Janet Bragg, Pat Midgley, Jenny Armstrong, Terry Fox, Anthony Downing, David Barker, Isobel Bowler, Nikki Bond, Qurban Hussain, Lynn Rooney, John Campbell, Martin Lawton, Sioned-Mair Richards, Peter Price, Leigh Bramall, Gill Furniss, Richard Crowther, Philip Wood, Neale Gibson, Nikki Sharpe, Adam Hurst, Alf Meade, Jackie Satur, Mick Rooney and Ray Satur.

Against Paragraph (i) (19)

Councillors Shaffaq Mohammed, Robert Murphy and Jillian Creasy, Rob Frost, Sylvia Anginotti, Colin Ross, Joe Otten, Penny Baker, Roger Davison, Sue Alston, Andrew Sangar, Cliff Woodcraft, Denise Reaney, Ian Auckland, Bob McCann, Katie Condliffe, David Baker, Alison Brelsford and Trevor Bagshaw.

Abstained on Paragraph (i)  
(1)

The Lord Mayor (Cllr Vickie Priestley).

**13. NOTICE OF MOTION GIVEN BY COUNCILLOR GEORGE LINDARS-HAMMOND**

**Access to Credit**

It was moved by Councillor George Lindars-Hammond, seconded by Councillor Mazher Iqbal that this Council:-

- (a) is extremely concerned about the growing cost of living crisis under the present Government;
- (b) notes that working people are today an average of £1,350 worse off a year since the present Government came to power and forecasts show that over the course of this Parliament, that figure will reach £6,660;
- (c) further notes that in the Yorkshire & Humber region the average fall in wages in real terms for all employees between 2010 and 2012 is 8.1% or £1,721 per year;
- (d) is dismayed at the growth of highly unaffordable credit from payday loans with interest rates often higher than 5000% APR.
- (e) is particularly concerned by evidence suggesting that their use is highest amongst our country's most deprived groups;
- (f) believes that credit unions offer far more suitable schemes for those in need of short-term credit and commits to further promote the activities of Sheffield Credit Union;
- (g) notes the excellent campaign by Paul Blomfield MP in proposing Parliamentary legislation to regulate the activities of payday lenders and calls on all Sheffield MPs to support his bill;
- (h) praises the University of Sheffield for banning payday loan companies from advertising on campus;
- (i) further supports other campaigns about payday loans including Unite the Union's 'Stop the sharks' campaign and Labour Student's campaign to

tackle payday loan companies targeting students; and

- (j) commits to reviewing advertising policy on Council sites to look to exclude payday loan advertising.

Whereupon, it was moved by Councillor Andrew Sangar, seconded by Councillor Roger Davison, as an amendment, that the Motion now submitted be amended by the deletion of all the words after the words "That this Council" and the substitution of the following words therefor:-

- (a) is flabbergasted that Labour politicians have the nerve to attack the Government on the cost of living, given that the previous Government:
  - (i) crashed the economy, which is why the cost of living is higher now;
  - (ii) scrapped the 10p tax, leaving half a million of the lowest paid worse off; and
  - (iii) increased the state pension by an insulting 75p;
- (b) backs the actions of Liberal Democrats in Government, which have stabilised the economy, keeping interest rates and mortgage payments low, while cutting tax for working families, freezing fuel duty and raising the state pension by record levels;
- (c) notes with grave concern the unscrupulous practices of payday lenders and the distressing impact on consumers;
- (d) regrets that the previous Government failed to take effective action despite thirteen years in power;
- (e) supports the steps taken by the current Government to more effectively regulate the pay-day lending market, including:
  - (i) passing regulatory control to the Financial Conduct Authority, which will clamp down on irresponsible practices with tough enforcement powers;
  - (ii) referring the industry to the Competition Commission through the Office of Fair Trading;
  - (iii) developing new restrictions on the advertising of pay day loans; and
  - (iv) introducing effective financial education in schools;
- (f) welcomes reports that roughly a third of lenders referred to the Office of Fair Trading have already left the market due to the tough enforcement action taken;
- (g) however, calls upon the Government to carefully consider independent research by the University of Bristol, which stated that:

"The evidence reviewed for this research does not show unequivocally that [interest rate restrictions] reduce the cost of borrowing to consumers, particularly those on low incomes";

- (h) furthermore, welcomes the comments of the Archbishop of Canterbury that “We’re not in the business of trying to legislate you out of existence, we’re trying to compete you out of existence”;
- (i) therefore, supports the Government’s decision to invest £38 million to help credit unions modernise and effectively compete with pay-day lenders; and
- (j) resolves to continue to promote credit unions and other ethical lenders in Sheffield.

On being put to the vote, the amendment was negated.

After a right of reply by Councillor George Lindars-Hammond, the original Motion was then put to the vote and carried, as follows:-

**RESOLVED:** That this Council:-

- (a) is extremely concerned about the growing cost of living crisis under the present Government;
- (b) notes that working people are today an average of £1,350 worse off a year since the present Government came to power and forecasts show that over the course of this Parliament, that figure will reach £6,660;
- (c) further notes that in the Yorkshire & Humber region the average fall in wages in real terms for all employees between 2010 and 2012 is 8.1% or £1,721 per year;
- (d) is dismayed at the growth of highly unaffordable credit from payday loans with interest rates often higher than 5000% APR.
- (e) is particularly concerned by evidence suggesting that their use is highest amongst our country’s most deprived groups;
- (f) believes that credit unions offer far more suitable schemes for those in need of short-term credit and commits to further promote the activities of Sheffield Credit Union;
- (g) notes the excellent campaign by Paul Blomfield MP in proposing Parliamentary legislation to regulate the activities of payday lenders and calls on all Sheffield MPs to support his bill;
- (h) praises the University of Sheffield for banning payday loan companies from advertising on campus;
- (i) further supports other campaigns about payday loans including Unite the Union’s ‘Stop the sharks’ campaign and Labour Student’s campaign to tackle payday loan companies targeting students; and

- |  |
|--|
| (j) commits to reviewing advertising policy on Council sites to look to exclude payday loan advertising. |
|--|

(Note: Councillors Shaffaq Mohammed, Rob Frost, Sylvia Anginotti, Colin Ross, Joe Otten, Penny Baker, Roger Davison, Sue Alston, Andrew Sangar, Cliff Woodcraft, Denise Reaney, Ian Auckland, Bob McCann, Katie Condliffe, David Baker, Alison Brelsford and Trevor Bagshaw voted for paragraphs (d), (e), (f), (h), (i) and (j) and against paragraphs (a), (b), (c) and (g) of the Substantive Motion and asked for this to be recorded.)

#### **14. NOTICE OF MOTION GIVEN BY COUNCILLOR BOB JOHNSON**

##### **Unemployment**

It was moved by Councillor Bob Johnson, seconded by Councillor Nikki Sharpe, that this Council:-

- (a) is concerned that youth unemployment has edged towards a million, increasing by 15,000 on the quarter, to 974,000;
- (b) regrets that the Deputy Prime Minister's flagship Youth Contract has paid out for less than 4,700 placements for its target group of 18- to 24-year-olds who have been out of work for more than six months;
- (c) supports efforts by the present Administration through the Sheffield Apprenticeship Programme, however, regrets that this local action is not backed up by national action from the Government;
- (d) is concerned that long-term unemployment continues to rise and the number of people out of work for more than twelve months increased on the quarter to 909,000;
- (e) regrets that more than half of the long-term unemployed have been out of work for more than two years, with 474,000 people being unemployed for more than two years, its highest level since June 1997;
- (f) believes that long-term unemployment is spiralling out of control because the Government's Work Programme has underperformed;
- (g) believes that the country urgently needs a real plan to get Britain back to work on a national level and supports Labour's Compulsory Jobs Guarantee, to get anyone locked out of employment for more than two years into a real paying job which they would be required to take;
- (h) is concerned that Remploy, Sharrow Industries and other vulnerable groups of workers, for instance, have suffered disproportionately due to Government cuts; and
- (i) is committed to assisting disabled people in employment and recognises

that, wherever possible, through the Council's procurement and commissioning processes, opportunities for these workers should be sought and bidders should evidence how they can assist the Council in achieving this goal and securing employment and support for these vulnerable workers.

Whereupon, it was moved by Councillor Colin Ross, seconded by Councillor Ian Auckland, as an amendment, that the Motion now submitted be amended by the deletion of all the words after the words "That this Council" and the substitution of the following words therefor:-

- (a) recalls the failure of the last Government to tackle the scandal of youth unemployment, with numbers rising steadily from 2004 onwards, reaching almost half a million prior to the economic crash;
- (b) praises the tough action taken by Liberal Democrats in Government, which has stabilised the British economy and is delivering economic growth;
- (c) welcomes action by Liberal Democrats in Government to support young people into jobs, including increased spending of £250 million on apprenticeships within the first year of the Coalition – a 50% increase on the previous Government's commitments;
- (d) notes that Sheffield has seen a massive 54% increase in the number of young people starting an apprenticeship, bringing the total number of people who have benefited from an apprenticeship since 2010 to 12,270;
- (e) reiterates that all participants on the Sheffield Apprenticeship Programme will receive at least Level 2 training, funded by the Coalition Government, and thanks the Government for this support;
- (f) reminds Members that it was the main opposition group that first suggested doubling the number of young people on the Sheffield Apprenticeship Programme and identified funding to do so;
- (g) is also delighted that a radical apprenticeship scheme forms a key pillar of the Government's City Deal with Sheffield and thanks Liberal Democrats in Government, in particular the Deputy Prime Minister, for helping to secure the deal;
- (h) supports the numerous other actions that have been taken to support young people into jobs in Sheffield, including:
  - (i) new jobs and investment at the Advanced Manufacturing Park;
  - (ii) a new University Technical College for Sheffield, which will provide the skills the next generation of Sheffielders need to compete;
  - (iii) a £1.2 billion investment enabling the Streets Ahead project to proceed, creating new jobs and apprenticeships;
  - (iv) massive investment in Sheffield's transport infrastructure including buses,

- (v) trams and trains; and  
a cut in National Insurance contributions, allowing businesses to create new jobs, which was opposed by the Administration;
- (i) contrasts this record of action to the Labour Party whose economic plans remain far from credible and would add an estimated £201 billion to the national debt; and
- (j) endorses the Liberal Democrats' 'A Million Jobs' campaign, which aims to support more young people in apprenticeships.

On being put to the vote, the amendment was negated. The original Motion was then put to the vote and carried, as follows:-

**RESOLVED:** That this Council:-

- (a) is concerned that youth unemployment has edged towards a million, increasing by 15,000 on the quarter, to 974,000;
- (b) regrets that the Deputy Prime Minister's flagship Youth Contract has paid out for less than 4,700 placements for its target group of 18- to 24-year-olds who have been out of work for more than six months;
- (c) supports efforts by the present Administration through the Sheffield Apprenticeship Programme, however, regrets that this local action is not backed up by national action from the Government;
- (d) is concerned that long-term unemployment continues to rise and the number of people out of work for more than twelve months increased on the quarter to 909,000;
- (e) regrets that more than half of the long-term unemployed have been out of work for more than two years, with 474,000 people being unemployed for more than two years, its highest level since June 1997;
- (f) believes that long-term unemployment is spiralling out of control because the Government's Work Programme has underperformed;
- (g) believes that the country urgently needs a real plan to get Britain back to work on a national level and supports Labour's Compulsory Jobs Guarantee, to get anyone locked out of employment for more than two years into a real paying job which they would be required to take;
- (h) is concerned that Remploy, Sharrow Industries and other vulnerable groups of workers, for instance, have suffered disproportionately due to Government cuts; and
- (i) is committed to assisting disabled people in employment and recognises that, wherever possible, through the Council's procurement and commissioning processes, opportunities for these workers should be

sought and bidders should evidence how they can assist the Council in achieving this goal and securing employment and support for these vulnerable workers.

(Note: 1.Councillors Simon Clement-Jones, Shaffaq Mohammed, Rob Frost, Sylvia Anginotti, Colin Ross, Joe Otten, Penny Baker, Roger Davison, Sue Alston, Andrew Sangar, Cliff Woodcraft, Denise Reaney, Ian Auckland, Bob McCann, Katie Condliffe, David Baker, Alison Brelsford and Trevor Bagshaw voted for paragraphs (a) and (i) and against paragraphs (b) to (h) of the Motion and asked for this to be recorded.

2. Councillors Jillian Creasy and Robert Murphy voted for paragraphs (a) to (f), (h) and (i); and abstained from voting on paragraph (g) of the Motion and asked for this to be recorded.)

## **15. NOTICE OF MOTION GIVEN BY COUNCILLOR IAN AUCKLAND**

### **Cycle Routes**

It was moved by Councillor Ian Auckland, seconded by Councillor David Baker, that this Council:-

- (a) is delighted that the 2014 Tour de France Grand Départ will take place in “God’s Own County” and will conclude its Yorkshire phase in Sheffield;
- (b) hopes the event will inspire hundreds of Sheffielders – young and old – to get out of their houses and onto their bikes;
- (c) therefore, welcomes news that the Liberal Democrats in Government have secured £5 million to improve cycle routes in the Peak District;
- (d) believes record investment in cycle infrastructure is yet another demonstration of the Liberal Democrats’ commitment in Government to building a stronger economy and a fairer society;
- (e) however, regrets that Sheffield City Council failed to submit a bid to the separate £77 million fund targeted at urban areas, which could have supported cyclists in the city-centre;
- (f) understands from local cyclists that numerous schemes could have been progressed had the Council been prepared for such a process and notes that in other cities the fund is being used to pursue new cycle lanes and 20 mph zones;
- (g) regrets that city-centre cyclists are now losing out as a result of the Administration’s lack of preparation or sheer incompetence; and
- (h) calls upon the Administration to develop a rolling list of priorities to ensure that future opportunities are not missed.

Whereupon, it was moved by Councillor Leigh Bramall, seconded by Councillor Cate McDonald, as an amendment, that the Motion now submitted be amended by:-

1. the deletion in paragraph (c) of the words “Liberal Democrats in Government” and their substitution by the words “present Administration”; and
2. the deletion of paragraphs (d) to (h) and the addition of new paragraphs (d) to (i) as follows:-
  - (d) regrets that the Liberal Democrats in Government abolished Cycling England and its £60 million annual budget and the Cycling City and Towns Programme that was established by the previous Government;
  - (e) believes that the Government were mistaken to go soft on road safety, in abandoning the previous Government’s road death reduction targets;
  - (f) is concerned by reports that the Secretary of State for Communities and Local Government said that the only people who were bothered about cycling were the “elite”;
  - (g) remembers the Leader of the main opposition group’s comments criticising Council investment in cycling in 2011 stating “Labour have got their priorities wrong” as a result of investing in cycle lane schemes in Penistone Road, the Halfway to Killamarsh Connect 2 Route and a cycleway along Meadowhead, Bochum Parkway and Dykes Lane, and deplores the cynical hypocrisy of the main opposition group;
  - (h) welcomes that the present Administration have already instructed officers to develop new routes which could benefit from future funding opportunities prior to the announcement of the Cycling Ambition Programme, and notes the lack of plans inherited from the previous Administration; and
  - (i) further welcomes the present Administration’s commitment to commission a scrutiny committee review to look at how cycling can be delivered in the City, the most significant piece of work with cycling in the City’s history.

On being put to the vote the amendment was carried.

The original Motion, as amended, was then put as a Substantive Motion in the following form and carried:-

**RESOLVED:** That this Council:-

- (a) is delighted that the 2014 Tour de France Grand Départ will take place in “God’s Own County” and will conclude its Yorkshire phase in Sheffield;

- (b) hopes the event will inspire hundreds of Sheffielders – young and old – to get out of their houses and onto their bikes;
- (c) therefore, welcomes news that the present Administration have secured £5 million to improve cycle routes in the Peak District;
- (d) regrets that the Liberal Democrats in Government abolished Cycling England and its £60 million annual budget and the Cycling City and Towns Programme that was established by the previous Government;
- (e) believes that the Government were mistaken to go soft on road safety, in abandoning the previous Government’s road death reduction targets;
- (f) is concerned by reports that the Secretary of State for Communities and Local Government said that the only people who were bothered about cycling were the “elite”;
- (g) remembers the Leader of the main opposition group’s comments criticising Council investment in cycling in 2011 stating “Labour have got their priorities wrong” as a result of investing in cycle lane schemes in Penistone Road, the Halfway to Killamarsh Connect 2 Route and a cycleway along Meadowhead, Bochum Parkway and Dykes Lane, and deplores the cynical hypocrisy of the main opposition group;
- (h) welcomes that the present Administration have already instructed officers to develop new routes which could benefit from future funding opportunities prior to the announcement of the Cycling Ambition Programme, and notes the lack of plans inherited from the previous Administration; and
- (i) further welcomes the present Administration’s commitment to commission a scrutiny committee review to look at how cycling can be delivered in the City, the most significant piece of work with cycling in the City’s history.

(Note: 1.Councillors Simon Clement-Jones, Shaffaq Mohammed, Rob Frost, Sylvia Anginotti, Colin Ross, Joe Otten, Penny Baker, Roger Davison, Sue Alston, Andrew Sangar, Cliff Woodcraft, Denise Reaney, Ian Auckland, Bob McCann, Katie Condliffe, David Baker, Alison Brelsford and Trevor Bagshaw voted for paragraphs (a), (b), (c), (h) and (i); and abstained on paragraphs (d) to (g) of the Motion and asked for this to be recorded.

2. Councillors Jillian Creasy and Robert Murphy voted for paragraphs (a) and (b),(c) (h) and (i); and abstained from voting on paragraphs (d) (e) (f) and (g) of the Motion and asked for this to be recorded.)

**16. NOTICE OF MOTION GIVEN BY COUNCILLOR JACK SCOTT**

### **Streets Ahead Project**

It was moved by Councillor Jack Scott, seconded by Councillor Nikki Bond, that this Council:-

- (a) notes that August 2013 marked the first year of the Streets Ahead Project, secured by the previous Labour Administration and the previous Government;
- (b) believes that the main opposition group have tried to erroneously claim that the Project was secured by the present Government when in fact all they have done is continue the previous Government's plans and regrets that the smallest opposition group have criticised the Project;
- (c) continues to fully support the Project, which has delivered the following achievements during the first year;
  - (i) resurfaced roads and pavements: 185 miles;
  - (ii) street light upgrades: 4,000;
  - (iii) energy saved from new street lights: 40%;
  - (iv) street cleaning litter collected: 75 tonnes per week – the equivalent weight of nine double decker buses;
  - (v) grass cutting: more than 2.8 million square metres of grass verges maintained each year – amount of grass cut equivalent to around 4,500 football pitches;
  - (vi) roadside drainage gullies cleaned: 63,500; and
  - (vii) distance travelled by city gritters last winter: Equivalent of five times around the world.
- (d) notes that the Project is on time and on budget;
- (e) welcomes that the scheme has directly created 282 new jobs including 29 apprentices and 15 graduate trainees, with hundreds more employed in the Project through suppliers; and
- (f) looks forward to seeing work start in Meadowhead, Woodseats, Beauchief and Hutcliffe Wood in September as the Project moves into its second year.

Whereupon, it was moved by Councillor Joe Otten, seconded by Councillor Simon Clement-Jones, as an amendment, that the Motion now submitted be amended by:-

1. the deletion of paragraphs (a) and (b);
2. the re-lettering of paragraphs (c) to (f) as new paragraphs (e) to (h); and
3. the addition of new paragraphs (a) to (d) as follows:-

- (a) recalls the previous Government's complete mismanagement of the nation's finances and their desperate last-ditch attempts to win votes through increasingly erratic and unfunded spending commitments;
- (b) therefore, underlines its belief that a spending commitment from the last Government was not worth the paper it was written on;
- (c) thanks Liberal Democrats in Government for helping to secure the £1.2 billion of funding to actually enable the Streets Ahead Project to proceed;
- (d) regrets that the smaller opposition group opposed the historic project, which will finally rid Sheffield of its pot-hole city tag;

On being put to the vote, the amendment was negated.

The original Motion was then put to the vote and carried, as follows:-

**RESOLVED:** That this Council:-

- (a) notes that August 2013 marked the first year of the Streets Ahead Project, secured by the previous Labour Administration and the previous Government;
- (b) believes that the main opposition group have tried to erroneously claim that the Project was secured by the present Government when in fact all they have done is continue the previous Government's plans and regrets that the smallest opposition group have criticised the Project;
- (c) continues to fully support the Project, which has delivered the following achievements during the first year;
  - (i) resurfaced roads and pavements: 185 miles;
  - (ii) street light upgrades: 4,000;
  - (iii) energy saved from new street lights: 40%;
  - (iv) street cleaning litter collected: 75 tonnes per week – the equivalent weight of nine double decker buses;
  - (v) grass cutting: more than 2.8 million square metres of grass verges maintained each year – amount of grass cut equivalent to around 4,500 football pitches;
  - (vi) roadside drainage gullies cleaned: 63,500; and
  - (vii) distance travelled by city gritters last winter: Equivalent of five times around the world.
- (d) notes that the Project is on time and on budget;
- (e) welcomes that the scheme has directly created 282 new jobs including 29 apprentices and 15 graduate trainees, with hundreds more employed in the Project through suppliers; and
- (f) looks forward to seeing work start in Meadowhead, Woodseats,

Beauchief and Hutcliffe Wood in September as the Project moves into its second year.

(Note: Councillors Simon Clement-Jones, Shaffaq Mohammed, Rob Frost, Sylvia Anginotti, Colin Ross, Joe Otten, Penny Baker, Roger Davison, Sue Alston, Andrew Sangar, Cliff Woodcraft, Denise Reaney, Ian Auckland, Bob McCann, Katie Condliffe, David Baker, Alison Brelsford and Trevor Bagshaw voted for paragraphs (c) to (f) and against paragraphs (a) and (b) of the Motion and asked for this to be recorded.)

**17. NOTICE OF MOTION GIVEN BY COUNCILLOR JACKIE DRAYTON**

**Homophobic Bullying**

**RESOLVED:** On the Motion of Councillor Jackie Drayton, seconded by Councillor Neale Gibson, that this Council:-

- (a) believes that homophobic bullying is unacceptable and must be stamped out;
- (b) welcomes that Stonewall has named the Council as one of the best authorities in the country for its ground-breaking work with schools to stamp out bullying against gay and lesbian youngsters, scoring it 91 per cent across its index;
- (c) notes comments from Wes Streeting, Stonewall Head of Education "Sheffield City Council deserves enormous congratulations on securing a Top 10 place in Stonewall's Education Equality Index. Homophobic bullying has a detrimental impact on the attendance, achievement and life chances of young people, so it's fantastic to see the work of the Council highlighted through the Index to inspire others to take action to make schools a safe and supportive place to help all young people to achieve their potential.";
- (d) further notes that Sheffield City Council, in partnership with a host of other organisations, has been at the forefront of an anti-homophobic bullying charter – which a number of secondary schools have now signed up to, with more being urged to come forward and join; and
- (e) thanks all the officers, schools, staff and young people who have worked hard for us to achieve this recognition.

**18. NOTICE OF MOTION GIVEN BY COUNCILLOR ROBERT MURPHY**

**Shale Gas and Coal Bed Methane Extraction**

It was moved by Councillor Robert Murphy, seconded by Councillor Jillian Creasy, that this Council:-

- (a) notes the presence of shale gas and coal bed methane in the Sheffield region;
- (b) notes the recent mass protests against shale gas drilling in both Lancashire and West Sussex;
- (c) notes the controversy about both the supposed benefits of extracting on-shore gas resources and the local environmental impacts;
- (d) notes the recent evidence that 60-80% of world fossil fuel reserves need to be left in the ground if average global temperature rise is to remain within 2 degrees;
- (e) believes that there is also compelling evidence that UK shale gas and coal bed methane would form part of that 60-80%;
- (f) notes that the large amounts of water needed for hydraulic fracturing to extract shale gas (known as fracking) would reduce water supplies in this region, which are also threatened by the impact of climate change;
- (g) notes the well-documented risk of groundwater contamination as a result of fracking, which would exacerbate the pressure on water supplies and put residents at risk;
- (h) notes the unavoidable increase in noise, visual intrusion and air pollution from heavy traffic in communities close to fracking sites;
- (i) therefore welcomes the work of the Cabinet Member for Environment, Recycling and Streetscene in developing a Council policy on shale gas and coal bed methane extraction;
- (j) will seek to attract to the City appropriate funding for projects which increase energy efficiency, sustainability and self-sufficiency, stabilise energy bills, and create jobs in the green economy; and
- (k) directs officers to send a copy of this motion to the Secretary of State for Energy and Climate Change and the Minister of State for the Department for Energy and Climate Change and to all Sheffield MPs.

Whereupon, it was moved by Councillor Joe Otten, seconded by Councillor Katie Condliffe, as an amendment, that the Motion now submitted be amended by:-

1. the deletion in paragraph (i) of the word “therefore” and its substitution by the word “cautiously”;
2. the deletion in paragraph (j) of the words “will seek” and their substitution by the word “seeks”;

3. the re-lettering of paragraphs (i) and (j) as new paragraphs (j) and (k) and the addition of a new paragraph (i) as follows:-
  - (i) supports the robust application of environmental, safety and local planning regulations to protect the rights of local communities;
4. the re-lettering of original paragraph (k) as a new paragraph (m) and the addition of a new paragraph (l) as follows:-
  - (l) therefore, regrets that so little progress has been made by the current Administration on the Decentralised Energy City Strategy agreed by the Cabinet in 2011;

On being put to the vote, the amendment was negatived.

It was moved by Councillor Jack Scott, seconded by Councillor Mohammed Maroof, as an amendment, that the Motion now submitted be amended by the re-lettering of paragraph (k) as a new paragraph (l) and the addition of a new paragraph (k) as follows:-

- (k) believes it is completely irresponsible for the Government to be offering massive tax-cuts for fracking and this money should instead have been used to kick-start a major national retrofit scheme, which would reduce carbon emissions and bills and create thousands of green-collar jobs;

On being put to the vote, the amendment was carried.

The original Motion, as amended, was then put as a Substantive Motion in the following form and carried:-

**RESOLVED:** That this Council:-

- (a) notes the presence of shale gas and coal bed methane in the Sheffield region;
- (b) notes the recent mass protests against shale gas drilling in both Lancashire and West Sussex;
- (c) notes the controversy about both the supposed benefits of extracting on-shore gas resources and the local environmental impacts;
- (d) notes the recent evidence that 60-80% of world fossil fuel reserves need to be left in the ground if average global temperature rise is to remain within 2 degrees;
- (e) believes that there is also compelling evidence that UK shale gas and coal bed methane would form part of that 60-80%;
- (f) notes that the large amounts of water needed for hydraulic fracturing to

- extract shale gas (known as fracking) would reduce water supplies in this region, which are also threatened by the impact of climate change;
- (g) notes the well-documented risk of groundwater contamination as a result of fracking, which would exacerbate the pressure on water supplies and put residents at risk;
  - (h) notes the unavoidable increase in noise, visual intrusion and air pollution from heavy traffic in communities close to fracking sites;
  - (i) therefore welcomes the work of the Cabinet Member for Environment, Recycling and Streetscene in developing a Council policy on shale gas and coal bed methane extraction;
  - (j) will seek to attract to the City appropriate funding for projects which increase energy efficiency, sustainability and self-sufficiency, stabilise energy bills, and create jobs in the green economy;
  - (k) believes it is completely irresponsible for the Government to be offering massive tax-cuts for fracking and this money should instead have been used to kick-start a major national retrofit scheme, which would reduce carbon emissions and bills and create thousands of green-collar jobs; and
  - (l) directs officers to send a copy of this motion to the Secretary of State for Energy and Climate Change and the Minister of State for the Department for Energy and Climate Change and to all Sheffield MPs.

The votes on the Substantive Motion were ordered to be recorded and were as follows:-

For Paragraphs (a), (b), (c), (d), (i), (j) and (l) (74) - The Deputy Lord Mayor (Cllr Peter Rippon) and Councillors Julie Dore, Jack Scott, Roy Munn, Simon Clement-Jones, Clive Skelton, Ian Saunders, Chris Rosling-Josephs, Helen Mirfin-Boukouris, Bryan Lodge, Denise Fox, Karen McGowan, Jayne Dunn, Stuart Wattam, Shaffaq Mohammed, Jackie Drayton, Ibrar Hussain, Talib Hussain, Robert Murphy, Jillian Creasy, Mohammed Maroof, Rob Frost, Geoff Smith, Sylvia Anginotti, Mary Lea, Mazher Iqbal, Colin Ross, Joe Otten, Joyce Wright, Steven Wilson, Garry Weatherall, Penny Baker, Sheila Constance, Chris Weldon, Alan Law, Sue Alston, Andrew Sangar, Cliff Woodcraft, Steve Jones, Tim Rippon, Cate McDonald, Denise Reaney, Ian Auckland, Bob McCann, George Lindars-Hammond, Robert Johnson, Janet Bragg, Pat Midgley, Terry Fox, Anthony Downing, David Barker, Isobel

Bowler, Nikki Bond, Qurban Hussain, Lynn Rooney, John Campbell, Martin Lawton, Sioned-Mair Richards, Peter Price, Leigh Bramall, Gill Furniss, Katie Condliffe, David Baker, Richard Crowther, Philip Wood, Alison Brelsford, Neale Gibson, Nikki Sharpe, Adam Hurst, Alf Meade, Trevor Bagshaw, Jackie Satur, Mick Rooney and Ray Satur.

Against Paragraphs (a), (b), (c), (d), (i), (j) and (l) (0) - Nil.

Abstained Paragraphs (a), (b), (c), (d), (i), (j) and (l) (1) - The Lord Mayor (Cllr Vickie Priestley).

For Paragraphs (e), (f), (g) and (h) (57) - The Deputy Lord Mayor (Cllr Peter Rippon) and Councillors Julie Dore, Jack Scott, Roy Munn, Clive Skelton, Ian Saunders, Chris Rosling-Josephs, Helen Mirfin-Boukouris, Bryan Lodge, Denise Fox, Karen McGowan, Jayne Dunn, Stuart Wattam, Jackie Drayton, Ibrar Hussain, Talib Hussain, Mohammed Maroof, Robert Murphy and Jillian Creasy, Geoff Smith, Mary Lea, Mazher Iqbal, Joyce Wright, Steven Wilson, Garry Weatherall, Sheila Constance, Chris Weldon, Alan Law, Steve Jones, Tim Rippon, Cate McDonald, George Lindars-Hammond, Robert Johnson, Janet Bragg, Pat Midgley, Terry Fox, Anthony Downing, David Barker, Isobel Bowler, Nikki Bond, Qurban Hussain, Lynn Rooney, John Campbell, Martin Lawton, Sioned-Mair Richards, Peter Price, Leigh Bramall, Gill Furniss, Richard Crowther, Philip Wood, Neale Gibson, Nikki Sharpe, Adam Hurst, Alf Meade, Jackie Satur, Mick Rooney and Ray Satur.

Against Paragraphs (e), (f), (g) and (h) (0) - Nil.

Abstained Paragraphs (e), (f), (g) and (h) (17) - Councillors Simon Clement-Jones, Shaffaq Mohammed, Rob Frost, Sylvia Anginotti, Colin Ross, Joe Otten, Penny Baker, Sue Alston, Andrew Sangar, Cliff Woodcraft, Denise Reaney, Ian Auckland, Bob McCann, Katie Condliffe, David Baker, Alison Brelsford and Trevor Bagshaw.

- For Paragraph (k) (57) - The Deputy Lord Mayor (Cllr Peter Rippon) and Councillors Julie Dore, Jack Scott, Roy Munn, Clive Skelton, Ian Saunders, Chris Rosling-Josephs, Helen Mirfin-Boukouris, Bryan Lodge, Denise Fox, Karen McGowan, Jayne Dunn, Stuart Wattam, Jackie Drayton, Ibrar Hussain, Talib Hussain, Mohammed Maroof, Robert Murphy and Jillian Creasy, Geoff Smith, Mary Lea, Mazher Iqbal, Joyce Wright, Steven Wilson, Garry Weatherall, Sheila Constance, Chris Weldon, Alan Law, Steve Jones, Tim Rippon, Cate McDonald, George Lindars-Hammond, Robert Johnson, Janet Bragg, Pat Midgley, Terry Fox, Anthony Downing, David Barker, Isobel Bowler, Nikki Bond, Qurban Hussain, Lynn Rooney, John Campbell, Martin Lawton, Sioned-Mair Richards, Peter Price, Leigh Bramall, Gill Furniss, Richard Crowther, Philip Wood, Neale Gibson, Nikki Sharpe, Adam Hurst, Alf Meade, Jackie Satur, Mick Rooney and Ray Satur.
- Against Paragraph (k) (17) - Councillors Simon Clement-Jones, Shaffaq Mohammed, Rob Frost, Sylvia Anginotti, Colin Ross, Joe Otten, Penny Baker, Sue Alston, Andrew Sangar, Cliff Woodcraft, Denise Reaney, Ian Auckland, Bob McCann, Katie Condliffe, David Baker, Alison Brelsford and Trevor Bagshaw.
- Abstained on Paragraph (k) (1) - The Lord Mayor (Cllr Vickie Priestley).

## **19. NOTICE OF MOTION GIVEN BY COUNCILLOR SHAFFAQ MOHAMMED**

### **Parking Permit Charges**

It was moved by Councillor Shaffaq Mohammed, seconded by Councillor Penny Baker, that this Council:-

- (a) welcomes the recent High Court ruling that Barnet Council had acted unlawfully by driving up parking permit fees as a landmark victory for motorists;
- (b) notes that as a result of this Administration's budgets, parking permit charges have been hiked by up to 260% and that the Council looks set to pocket a £1.2 million surplus from the zones this year;

- (c) confirms that this hike has not only hit struggling families but also damaged small businesses across Sheffield;
- (d) believes it is wrong for an administration to fleece local motorists to pay for their own political pet projects; and
- (e) calls for an immediate review of parking permit charges in light of the recent High Court ruling.

Note: With the agreement of Council and at the request of Councillor Shaffaq Mohammed, the above Motion was altered by the deletion of Paragraph (d) of the Notice of Motion as included in the Summons for this meeting.

Whereupon, it was moved by Councillor Robert Murphy, seconded by Councillor Jillian Creasy, as an amendment, that the Motion now submitted be amended by the addition of new paragraphs (d) and (e) and the re-lettering of subsequent paragraphs as follows:-

- (d) believes Pay and Display machines are an integral part of Permit Parking Zones and that Pay and Display enables drivers from outside using the area to contribute to the upkeep of schemes that benefit all motorists using the zone; and
- (e) believes it is unfair that residents and businesses in the often deprived areas adversely affected by parking should subsidise City wide transport spending.

It was then moved by Councillor Leigh Bramall, seconded by Councillor Denise Fox, as an amendment, that the Motion now submitted be amended by the deletion of all the words after the words "That this Council" and the substitution of the following words therefor:-

- (a) regrets that the need to increase parking permit charges is a result of the unprecedented level of cuts imposed upon the Council by the Government and notes that the Council has had to save over £180 million in the past three years;
- (b) acknowledges comments by the Chief Secretary to the Treasury, the Rt. Hon. Danny Alexander MP, that local government has "borne the brunt of deficit reduction" and notes that whilst Sheffield is hit with heavy cuts, wealthier areas of the country are receiving next to no cuts at all and believes that this is fundamentally unfair;
- (c) notes that, even with the increases, the cost of Sheffield resident parking permits are now £36 per year which is the same level they were before 2010 and, with the huge level of cuts imposed on the Council, understands it is no longer possible to maintain the reduced rate;

- (d) deplores the hypocrisy of the main opposition group who doubled the pay and display rates in 2011 and, after campaigning against a rise in the price of permits from £10 to £20, they did a U-turn and failed to reverse it in their 2013/14 budget proposal;
- (e) regrets the misleading nature of the Leader of the main opposition group's motion who has included all income from pay and display and enforcement, adding other income to make it look like the Administration is making profit from people who have permits when this is not the case; and
- (f) notes that the argument the main opposition group are making which includes enforcement and pay and display income, figures from the 2011/12 budget which the previous Administration passed produced a surplus of £870k and regrets that this embarrassing level of hypocrisy demonstrates there is no length that the Leader of the main opposition group will not go to, to score a cheap political point no matter how misleading or disingenuous.

On being put to the vote, the amendment was carried.

The votes on the above amendment were ordered to be recorded and were as follows:-

- For the amendment (55) - The Deputy Lord Mayor (Cllr Peter Rippon) and Councillors Julie Dore, Jack Scott, Roy Munn, Clive Skelton, Ian Saunders, Chris Rosling-Josephs, Helen Mirfin-Boukouris, Bryan Lodge, Denise Fox, Karen McGowan, Jayne Dunn, Stuart Wattam, Jackie Drayton, Ibrar Hussain, Talib Hussain, Mohammed Maroof, Geoff Smith, Mary Lea, Mazher Iqbal, Joyce Wright, Steven Wilson, Garry Weatherall, Sheila Constance, Chris Weldon, Alan Law, Steve Jones, Tim Rippon, Cate McDonald, George Lindars-Hammond, Robert Johnson, Janet Bragg, Pat Midgley, Terry Fox, Anthony Downing, David Barker, Isobel Bowler, Nikki Bond, Qurban Hussain, Lynn Rooney, John Campbell, Martin Lawton, Sioned-Mair Richards, Peter Price, Leigh Bramall, Gill Furniss, Richard Crowther, Philip Wood, Neale Gibson, Nikki Sharpe, Adam Hurst, Alf Meade, Jackie Satur, Mick Rooney and Ray Satur.
- Against the amendment (19) - Councillors Simon Clement-Jones, Shaffaq Mohammed, Robert Murphy and Jillian Creasy, Rob Frost, Sylvia Anginotti, Colin

Ross, Joe Otten, Penny Baker, Sue Alston, Andrew Sangar, Cliff Woodcraft, Denise Reaney, Ian Auckland, Bob McCann, Katie Condliffe, David Baker, Alison Brelsford and Trevor Bagshaw.

Abstained on the amendment - The Lord Mayor (Cllr Vickie Priestley).  
(1)

The original Motion, as amended, was then put as a Substantive Motion in the following form and carried:-

RESOLVED: That this Council:-

- (a) regrets that the need to increase parking permit charges is a result of the unprecedented level of cuts imposed upon the Council by the Government and notes that the Council has had to identify savings of over £180 million in the past three years;
- (b) acknowledges comments by the Chief Secretary to the Treasury, the Rt. Hon. Danny Alexander MP, that local government has “borne the brunt of deficit reduction” and notes that whilst Sheffield is hit with heavy cuts, wealthier areas of the country are receiving next to no cuts at all and believes that this is fundamentally unfair;
- (c) notes that, even with the increases, the cost of Sheffield resident parking permits are now £36 per year which is the same level they were before 2010 and, with the huge level of cuts imposed on the Council, understands it is no longer possible to maintain the reduced rate;
- (d) deplores the hypocrisy of the main opposition group who doubled the pay and display rates in 2011 and, after campaigning against a rise in the price of permits from £10 to £20, they did a u-turn on their position and failed to reverse it in their 2013/14 budget proposal;
- (e) regrets the misleading nature of the Leader of the main opposition group’s motion who has included all income from pay and display and enforcement, adding other income to make it look like the Administration is making profit from people who have permits when this is not the case; and
- (f) notes that the argument the main opposition group is making which includes enforcement and pay and display income, figures from the 2011/12 budget which the previous Administration passed produced a

surplus of £870k and regrets that this embarrassing level of hypocrisy demonstrates there is no length that the Leader of the main opposition group will not go to, to score a cheap political point no matter how misleading or disingenuous.

**20. NOTICE OF MOTION GIVEN BY COUNCILLOR NEALE GIBSON**

**Barclays Bank – Money Transfer Accounts**

**RESOLVED:** On the Motion of Councillor Neale Gibson, seconded by Councillor Mohammed Maroof, that this Council:-

- (a) calls upon Barclays Bank to reconsider their decision to withdraw the accounts it holds for UK money-transfer firms, something that is believed will negatively affect thousands of people and businesses across the City, particularly ethnic minority communities;
- (b) notes that in Sheffield it will particularly affect the large number of families from Somaliland and the decision will also impact the wider international community, because this vital function allows money-transfer firms to send funds from the UK to places like the Indian subcontinent and Africa;
- (c) further notes that remittance flows play an important role in providing direct support to families and poverty alleviation and local business traders are therefore concerned that this decision may lead to closure of these companies, which provide a vital service;
- (d) is also concerned that the market for money-transfer will be limited to a handful of companies causing fees to rise, resulting in decreases of remittances and at worst drive remittance giving underground;
- (e) believes that whilst it is right for Barclays to undertake reviews of its anti-money laundering and counter-terrorism policies and take action against such activities, the criteria with which Barclays has decided to withdraw its accounts is unclear and further believes that Barclays needs to ensure it considers the wider value and contribution of money-transfer agencies to ethnic minority communities in Sheffield and across the country, as well as the economy of the UK and developing countries; and
- (f) urges Barclays to consider delaying the withdrawal of these accounts for an extended period of at least 6 months, while alternative solutions are sought.

**21. NOTICE OF MOTION GIVEN BY COUNCILLOR ANDREW SANGAR**

**Sheffield Bus Partnership**

It was moved by Councillor Andrew Sangar, seconded by Councillor Cliff Woodcraft, that this Council:-

- (a) notes the proposed changes to Sheffield bus routes recently published by the Sheffield Bus Partnership; and
- (b) regrets that the consultation was held over the summer holidays, a principle which was slammed by the Cabinet Member for Communities and Inclusion as 'ridiculous'.

Whereupon, it was moved by Councillor Ian Auckland, seconded by Councillor Simon Clement-Jones, as an amendment, that the Motion now submitted be amended by the addition of new paragraphs (c) to (f) as follows:-

- (c) welcomes any improvements to the network but does not believe that these changes should come at the expense of a worse service to other communities;
- (d) specifically opposes changes to the 17, 20, 20a and 123 services, which will see a reduced service to Norton Lees, Thorpe House, Norton, Chancet Wood and Endcliffe;
- (e) believes these proposed changes serve as yet another demonstration of the failure of the Sheffield Bus Partnership to deliver the improved service promised by the Administration; and
- (f) calls upon the Partnership to listen to public outcry and scrap the proposed changes to the aforementioned services.

On being put to the vote, the amendment was negatived

It was then moved by Councillor Leigh Bramall, seconded by Councillor Jayne Dunn, as an amendment, that the original Motion now submitted be amended by:-

1. the addition of a new paragraph (a) as follows:-
  - (a) Agrees with comments from Transport Minister, Norman Baker MP, that the Sheffield Bus Partnership Agreement is "good news for the City";
2. the re-lettering of original paragraph (a) as a new paragraph (b);
3. the deletion of original paragraph (b); and
4. the addition of a new paragraph (c) as follows:-
  - (c) is committed to developing a stable, sustainable bus network, and wants people to say what they think to make Sheffield's bus network even

better.

On being put to the vote the amendment was carried.

The votes on the above amendment were ordered to be recorded and were as follows:-

- For the amendment (55)        -    The Deputy Lord Mayor (Cllr Peter Rippon) and Councillors Julie Dore, Jack Scott, Roy Munn, Clive Skelton, Ian Saunders, Chris Rosling-Josephs, Helen Mirfin-Boukouris, Bryan Lodge, Denise Fox, Karen McGowan, Jayne Dunn, Stuart Wattam, Jackie Drayton, Ibrar Hussain, Talib Hussain, Mohammed Maroof, Geoff Smith, Mary Lea, Mazher Iqbal, Joyce Wright, Steven Wilson, Garry Weatherall, Sheila Constance, Chris Weldon, Alan Law, Steve Jones, Tim Rippon, Cate McDonald, George Lindars-Hammond, Robert Johnson, Janet Bragg, Pat Midgley, Terry Fox, Anthony Downing, David Barker, Isobel Bowler, Nikki Bond, Qurban Hussain, Lynn Rooney, John Campbell, Martin Lawton, Sioned-Mair Richards, Peter Price, Leigh Bramall, Gill Furniss, Richard Crowther, Neale Gibson, Nikki Sharpe, Adam Hurst, Alf Meade, Jackie Satur, Mick Rooney and Ray Satur.
- Against the amendment (19)   -    Councillors Simon Clement-Jones, Shaffaq Mohammed, Robert Murphy and Jillian Creasy, Rob Frost, Sylvia Anginotti, Colin Ross, Joe Otten, Penny Baker, Sue Alston, Andrew Sangar, Cliff Woodcraft, Denise Reaney, Ian Auckland, Bob McCann, Katie Condliffe, David Baker, Alison Brelsford and Trevor Bagshaw.
- Abstained on the amendment   -    The Lord Mayor (Cllr Vickie Priestley).  
(1)

The original Motion, as amended, was then put as a Substantive Motion in the following form and carried:-

**RESOLVED:** That this Council:-

- (a)    Agrees with comments from Transport Minister, Norman Baker MP, that the Sheffield Bus Partnership Agreement is “good news for the City”;

- (b) notes the proposed changes to Sheffield bus routes recently published by the Sheffield Bus Partnership; and
- (c) is committed to developing a stable, sustainable bus network, and wants people to say what they think to make Sheffield's bus network even better.

(Note: Councillors Robert Murphy and Jillian Creasy voted for Paragraphs (b) and (c) and against Paragraph (a) and asked for this to be recorded)