

SHEFFIELD CITY COUNCIL

Planning and Highways Committee

Meeting held 2 June 2020

PRESENT: Councillors Peter Rippon (Chair), Jack Clarkson, Tony Damms, Roger Davison, Jayne Dunn, Peter Garbutt, Dianne Hurst, Alan Law, Peter Price, Chris Rosling-Josephs, Andrew Sangar and Joe Otten (Substitute Member)

.....

1. APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

1.1 Apologies for absence were received from Councillors Bob McCann and Zahira Naz.

1.2 Councillor Joe Otten acted as substitute for Councillor Bob McCann.

2. EXCLUSION OF PUBLIC AND PRESS

2.1 No items were identified where resolutions may be moved to exclude the press and public.

3. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

3.1 Councillor Dianne Hurst declared a personal interest in Agenda Item No. 8a, Application No. 19/03143/FUL – Land off Moorthorpe Way, Sheffield, S20 6PD, as she lived locally to the site. Councillor Hurst declared that she had not given an opinion or declared her position on the application prior to the meeting, therefore would take part in the discussion and voting thereon.

3.2 Councillor Peter Rippon declared a personal interest in Agenda Item No. 8a, Application No. 19/03143/FUL – Land off Moorthorpe Way, Sheffield, S20 6PD, as Dr. Patrick Harrison, one of the public speakers, was his nephew. Councillor Rippon declared that he had not given an opinion or declared his position on the application therefore would take part in the discussion and voting thereon.

3.3 Councillor Chris Rosling-Josephs declared a personal interest in Agenda Item No. 8a, Application No. 19/03143/FUL – Land off Moorthorpe Way, Sheffield, S20 6PD, as a local ward Member. Councillor Rosling-Josephs declared that he had not given an opinion or declared his position on the application prior to the meeting, therefore would take part in the discussion and voting thereon.

3.4 Councillor Jack Clarkson declared a personal interest in Agenda Item No's. 8b, Application No. 18/01543/FUL – Internet Refractory Products Ltd, Platts Lane Oughtibridge, Sheffield, S35 0HP and 8c, Application No. 17/00161/FUL - Land at the Junction of Oughtibridge Lane and Platts Lane, Sheffield, S35 0HP, as a local ward Member. Councillor Clarkson declared that he had not given an opinion or

declared his position on the applications prior to the meeting, therefore would take part in the discussions and voting thereon.

4. MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETING

- 4.1 The minutes of the meeting of the Committee held on 12th May 2020 were approved as a correct record.

5. SITE VISIT

- 5.1 **RESOLVED:** That the Chief Planning Officer, in liaison with a Co-Chair, be authorised to make any arrangements for a site visit, in connection with any planning applications requiring a visit by Members, prior to the next meeting of the Committee.

6. TREE PRESERVATION ORDER NO. 437 AT 45 ST ANDREW'S ROAD, SHEFFIELD, S11 9AL

- 6.1 The Director of City Growth submitted a report seeking to confirm Tree Preservation Order No. 437 made on 30th January 2020, to protect the tree in the front garden of 45 St Andrew's Road, Sheffield, S11 9AL. The report stated that the tree was considered to be under threat because an application for it to be felled had been received. A Tree Evaluation Method for Preservation Orders (TEMPO) assessment was carried out prior to making the Order, which found the tree suitable for protection. In view of the assessment, it was considered expedient to make an Order to protect the tree.
- 6.2 The Tree Preservation Order, Tree Schedule, site plan and TEMPO were attached to the report now submitted.
- 6.3 **RESOLVED:** That Tree Preservation Order No. 437, made on 30th January 2020, in respect of a tree in the front garden of 45 St Andrew's Road, Sheffield, S11 9AL, be confirmed unmodified.

7. APPLICATIONS UNDER VARIOUS ACTS/REGULATIONS

7a. APPLICATION NO. 19/03143/FUL - LAND OFF MOORTHORPE WAY, SHEFFIELD, S20 6PD.

- 7a.1 Additional representations, officer updates, amended conditions and amended heads of terms were included within the Supplementary Report circulated and summarised at the meeting. A late representation from the Woodland Trust was also drawn to the attention of Members.
- 7a.2 The Officer presented the report which gave details of the application and highlighted the history of the site and the key issues set out in the report.

- 7a.3 Clive Betts MP, Councillor Bob McCann, Ms. Claire Baker (Owlthorpe Action Group (OAG)), Mr. Gary Monaghan (OAG), Ms. Christine Rippon (OAG), Ms. Liz Ballard (Wildlife Trust), Mr. Andy Tickle (Campaign to Protect Rural England), Dr. Patrick Harrison, Ms. Sandra Fretwell-Smith and Mr. Brian Holmshaw attended the Committee and spoke against the application.
- 7a.4 Ms. Clare Plant attended the Committee and spoke in support of the application.
- 7a.5 The Committee considered the report and proposed conditions having regard to the development plan, the National Planning Policy Framework and other relevant considerations as summarised in the report and supplementary report now submitted and also having regard to representations made during the meeting.
- 7a.6 **RESOLVED:** That Application No. 19/03413/FUL - Erection of 74 dwellings, formation of access road, associated landscaping works, open space works and flood storage works at land off Moorthorpe Way, Sheffield, S20 6PD be REFUSED on the grounds of the failure to deliver development across the wider site in a comprehensive manner, the insufficient density of housing proposed on the site and consequential loss of amenity for existing residents and the location of affordable housing on the site. The decision notice to be formulated and the final wording to be delegated to the Chief Planning Officer in consultation with the Co-Chairs of the Planning and Highways Committee.
- 7b. APPLICATION NO. 18/01543/FUL - INTERNET REFRACTORY PRODUCTS LTD, PLATTS LANE, OUGHTIBRIDGE, SHEFFIELD, S35 0HP.**
- 7b.1 The Officer presented the report which gave details of the application and highlighted the history of the site and the key issues set out in the report.
- 7b.2 Mr. Phil Owen attended the meeting and spoke in support of the application.
- 7b.3 The Committee considered the report and proposed conditions having regard to the development plan, the National Planning Policy Framework and other relevant considerations as summarised in the report now submitted and also having regard to representations made during the meeting.
- 7b.4 **RESOLVED:** That Application No. 18/01543/FUL - Demolition of existing buildings and erection of 70 dwellings (amended plans and description) at Internet Refractory Products Ltd, Platts Lane, Oughtibridge, Sheffield, S35 0HP be REFUSED for the following reasons:
1. The Local Planning Authority consider that the proposed highways improvements, which include signalling the rail bridge on Oughtibridge Lane, would have an unacceptable impact on the safety of pedestrians, cyclists, vehicles and other road users, and detrimentally effect the free and safe flow of traffic on Oughtibridge Lane and Station Lane. The development is therefore contrary to Policy IB9 (f) of the Sheffield Unitary Development Plan, Policy CS51 (e) of the Core Strategy and paragraphs 108 (b) and (c), 109 and 110 (c) of the National Planning Policy Framework.

2. The Local Planning Authority considers that as the application site and the facilities and services in Oughtibridge (including public transport) cannot be accessed safely, the scheme represents an unsustainable and unsuitable form of residential development that does not take opportunities to prioritise and promote sustainable transport and access. The development is therefore contrary to Policies IB9 (f) and H15 (a) of the Sheffield Unitary Development Plan, Policies CS23, CS51 (b) and (e), CS53 (a) and CS63 (a), (c) and (h) of the Core Strategy and Paragraphs 8 (b), 91 (a) and (c), 102 (c), 108 (a) and (c), 110 (a) and (c) and 127 (f) of the National Planning Policy Framework.

7c. APPLICATION NO. 17/00161/FUL - LAND AT THE JUNCTION OF OUGHTIBRIDGE LANE AND PLATTS LANE, SHEFFIELD, S35 0HP.

7c.1 The Officer presented the report which gave details of the application and highlighted the history of the site and the key issues set out in the report.

7c.2 Mr. Phil Owen had spoken in support of the previous application and his comments were also relevant to this application.

7c.3 The Committee considered the report and proposed conditions having regard to the development plan, the National Planning Policy Framework and other relevant considerations as summarised in the report now submitted and also having regard to representations made during the meeting.

7c.4 **RESOLVED:** That Application No. 17/00161/FUL - Erection of 34x dwellings with associated access, parking and landscaping works at land at the junction of Oughtibridge Lane and Platts Lane, Sheffield, S35 0HP be REFUSED for the following reasons:

1. The Local Planning Authority consider that the proposed highways improvements, which include signalling the rail bridge on Oughtibridge Lane, would have an unacceptable impact on the safety of pedestrians, cyclists, vehicles and other road users, and detrimentally effect the free and safe flow of traffic on Oughtibridge Lane and Station Lane. The development is therefore contrary to Policy IB9 (f) of the Sheffield Unitary Development Plan, Policy CS51 (e) of the Core Strategy and paragraphs 108 (b) and (c), 109 and 110 (c) of the National Planning Policy Framework.

2. The Local Planning Authority considers that as the application site and the facilities and services in Oughtibridge (including public transport) cannot be accessed safely, the scheme represents an unsustainable and unsuitable form of residential development that does not take opportunities to prioritise and promote sustainable transport and access. The development is therefore contrary to Policies IB9 (f) and H15 (a) of the Sheffield Unitary Development Plan, Policies CS23, CS51 (b) and (e), CS53 (a) and CS63 (a), (c) and (h) of the Core Strategy and Paragraphs 8 (b), 91 (a) and (c), 102 (c), 108 (a) and (c), 110 (a) and (c) and 127 (f) of the National Planning Policy Framework.

8. DATE AND TIME OF FUTURE MEETINGS

- 8.1 **RESOLVED:** That future meetings of the Planning and Highways Committee be held on a 3 weekly basis on the following Tuesdays at 2.00pm:-

23rd June 2020
14th July 2020
4th August 2020
25th August 2020
15th September 2020
6th October 2020
27th October 2020
17th November 2020
8th December 2020
12th January 2021
2nd February 2021
23rd February 2021
16th March 2021
6th April 2021
27th April 2021
18th May 2021
8th June 2021

9. DATE OF NEXT MEETING

- 9.1 It was noted that the next meeting of the Planning and Highways Committee would be held on Tuesday 23rd June 2020 at 2pm.