



## Report to Economic and Environmental Wellbeing Scrutiny & Policy Development Committee

23<sup>rd</sup> July 2019

**Report of:** Executive Director of Place

**Subject:** Tackling air pollution:  
Sheffield's Clean Air Zone proposals

**Author of Report:** Tom Finnegan-Smith  
Head of Strategic Transport and Infrastructure  
City Growth, Sheffield City Council  
[tom.finnegan-smith@sheffield.gov.uk](mailto:tom.finnegan-smith@sheffield.gov.uk)

### Summary:

This paper provides an update for the Committee on the development of Sheffield's proposals to introduce a Class C charging Clean Air Zone in the city as part of our approach to tackling harmful Nitrogen Dioxide (NO<sub>2</sub>) from road traffic in the city. Building on the valuable EEW Scrutiny Committee discussion in November 2018, this updates Members on the latest position and offers the Committee the opportunity to contribute to the statutory consultation on the CAZ proposals.

### Type of item:

Reviewing of existing policy	X
Informing the development of new policy	
Statutory consultation	X
Performance / budget monitoring report	
Cabinet request for scrutiny	
Full Council request for scrutiny	
Community Assembly request for scrutiny	
Call-in of Cabinet decision	
Briefing paper for the Scrutiny Committee	X
Other	

## **The Scrutiny Committee is being asked to:**

1. Consider the issues set out in the paper, in particular providing perspectives on:
    - How the CAZ proposals have been received by citizens and communities across the city
    - The Outline Business Case as a whole
    - The proposed geography of the Clean Air Zone – ie. the area in which charging will be introduced
    - The consultation, including anything we could do to support more citizens to have a say
    - The draft support packages which we are looking to introduce to support businesses and drivers.
  2. Consider developing a formal response to the Clean Air Zone consultation which can then be published and considered in the Final Business Case.
- 

## **Background Papers:**

HMG (2017) *UK plan for tackling roadside nitrogen dioxide concentrations*, here: <https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/air-quality-plan-for-nitrogen-dioxide-no2-in-uk-2017>

Sheffield City Council (2017) *Clean Air Strategy*, <http://www.sheffield.gov.uk/content/dam/sheffield/docs/pollution-and-nuisance/air-pollution/clean-air-zone/Responses%20to%20Taxi%20Driver%20Questions.pdf>

Sheffield City Council (2018) *Air that is safe to breathe for all: Sheffield's Clean Air Zone proposal*, Item 9 of Cabinet Meeting of 21<sup>st</sup> November 2018, <http://democracy.sheffield.gov.uk/ieListDocuments.aspx?CId=123&MIId=6989&Ver=4>

Sheffield City Council (2018) *Clean Air Zone: Outline Business Case*, <http://www.sheffield.gov.uk/content/dam/sheffield/docs/pollution-and-nuisance/air-pollution/clean-air-zone/Sheffield%20and%20Rotherham%20CAZ%20-%20Outline%20Business%20Case.pdf>

More information: [www.sheffield.gov.uk/cleanair](http://www.sheffield.gov.uk/cleanair)

**Category of Report:** OPEN

# Tackling air pollution: Sheffield's Clean Air Zone proposals

## Summary of our Clean Air Zone proposals

1. Air pollution has been identified by the World Health Organisation (WHO) as one of the most significant public health challenges of our time (“air pollution is the new tobacco”)<sup>1</sup>. In 2017, Sheffield City Council published its Clean Air Strategy<sup>2</sup> which set out our commitment to significantly reducing the impact that air pollution has on citizens across all our communities, particularly recognising that it is the more vulnerable communities in Sheffield (younger, older, those with long-standing health conditions) that are most impacted on by harmful air. In 2018, Sheffield and Rotherham were one of 29 cities in England legally required by Government to reduce Nitrogen Dioxide emissions from vehicles to below the legal limit in the ‘shortest possible time’.
2. In October 2018, Sheffield City Council’s Cabinet decided<sup>3</sup> to submit a proposal to Government for a Class C charging Clean Air Zone (CAZ) in order to reduce Nitrogen Dioxide (NO<sub>2</sub>) emissions from road transport in the city to within the legal limit<sup>4</sup>. The proposed zone will cover the city centre *up to and including* the inner ring road and will mean that any buses, taxis, private hire vehicles, Heavy Goods Vehicles (HGVs), and Light Goods Vehicles (LGVs) that do not meet specified emissions standards will have to pay a daily pollution charge to drive in and around the Zone.
3. As set out in the Cabinet Paper, the proposals are premised on access to significant Government investment to support those businesses and drivers most affected by the proposed charges to upgrade or replace their polluting vehicles with cleaner alternatives. Through detailed modelling and analysis of traffic flows and air quality in the city, this approach is shown to reduce NO<sub>2</sub> pollution to within the legal limit in the ‘shortest possible time’ by accelerating the replacement of the vehicles that disproportionately cause NO<sub>2</sub> pollution in Sheffield. We held a detailed discussion with the Economic and Environmental Wellbeing Scrutiny Committee in November 2018<sup>5</sup>.

## Proposed Clean Air Zone



<sup>1</sup> Tedros Adhanom Ghebreyesus, (2018) *Air pollution is the new tobacco. Time to tackle this epidemic*, in The Guardian, <https://www.theguardian.com/environment/2018/oct/27/air-pollution-is-the-new-tobacco-warns-who-head>

<sup>2</sup> Sheffield City Council (2017) *Clean Air Strategy*, <http://www.sheffield.gov.uk/content/dam/sheffield/docs/pollution-and- nuisance/air-pollution/clean-air-zone/Responses%20to%20Taxi%20Driver%20Questions.pdf>

<sup>3</sup> Sheffield City Council (2018) *Air that is safe to breathe for all: Sheffield's Clean Air Zone proposal*, Item 9 of Cabinet Meeting of 21<sup>st</sup> November 2018, <http://democracy.sheffield.gov.uk/ieListDocuments.aspx?CId=123&MId=6989&Ver=4>

<sup>4</sup> The legal limit is 40µg/m<sup>3</sup>. This requirement along with more detail on the Government's plan to tackle NO<sub>2</sub> tailpipe emissions can be found in the *UK plan for tackling roadside nitrogen dioxide concentrations*, here: <https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/air-quality-plan-for-nitrogen-dioxide-no2-in-uk-2017>

<sup>5</sup> Sheffield City Council (2018) *Economic and Environmental Scrutiny and Policy Committee*, 28<sup>th</sup> November 2018, <http://democracy.sheffield.gov.uk/ieListDocuments.aspx?CId=136&MId=7065&Ver=4>

4. As instructed by Cabinet, the CAZ proposals were set out in an Outline Business Case (OBC) which was then submitted to the Government's Joint Air Quality Unit (JAQU) at the end of December 2018. The full OBC document is available on the City Council website here:

<http://www.sheffield.gov.uk/content/dam/sheffield/docs/pollution-and-nuisance/air-pollution/clean-air-zone/Sheffield%20and%20Rotherham%20CAZ%20-%20Outline%20Business%20Case.pdf>

5. In addition to setting out the detailed proposals for the CAZ itself, the OBC also outlines how we could look to use Government investment to support businesses and drivers to access cleaner vehicles. Clearly, there are legal (eg. State Aid) and financial constraints (ie. resource available from Government) on *how* we support drivers. The proposals mainly involve a mix of loans to buy cleaner vehicles, grants to support retrofitting (where possible) and additional offers to further incentivise drivers to take action (eg. electric vehicle charging vouchers).
6. The OBC also demonstrates that, whilst the CAZ is focused on the inner ring road and city centre, the impact of the air quality improvement will be positive across Sheffield and Rotherham. This is because the vehicles that we are proposing to upgrade/replace travel to towns and neighbourhoods across our city; so a cleaner bus that travels from Ecclesfield to Bents Green will pollute less throughout its entire journey, not just in the city centre.
7. The OBC sets out the other models – both geographical scale and different classes of charging zone – that we tested as part of our analysis. This demonstrates that our proposed Class C charging zone with additional measures to support drivers to replace their vehicles is likely to be the most effective at achieving legal compliance while minimising the financial impact for road users.
8. In particular, the OBC analysis indicates that it is the lowest income households living in Sheffield and Rotherham that disproportionately benefit from the proposed CAZ intervention, thus ensuring that we are starting to address the social injustice of air pollution in Sheffield.

### **Progress since December 2018**

9. We have continued to work with colleagues from Rotherham and JAQU on the development of the proposals. This has included a formal presentation to JAQU Officials in January 2019 and further enhancing our evidence base and modelling in response to specific recommendations of Government's Technical Independent Review Panel (TIRP).
10. We have initiated the key workstreams which will be vital to the delivery of the CAZ, pending final approval of our proposals by Government. This includes taking steps to enable SCC to procure the necessary camera infrastructure, drafting the Charging Order which would give SCC the legal powers to charge non-compliant vehicles for entering the CAZ and further development of the proposed loan and grant packages.

11. Air pollution is a *whole-city challenge* which necessitates a *whole-city response*. We have been working with the city's anchor institutions, the business sector (eg. Chamber of Commerce and City Growth Board) and key stakeholders (taxi associations, Health and Wellbeing Board, Sheffield City Partnership Board, and bus operators) to discuss our proposals and consider how we can work together to tackle harmful pollution, recognising the threat it poses to our population.
12. As we have repeatedly made clear, whilst we aren't proposing to charge people to drive private cars in or through our CAZ, our ambition has to be more than just achieving the legally defined standard for NO<sub>2</sub>, with the CAZ one part of our interventions to tackle air pollution and the climate emergency. As part of our proposals, we have developed a clean air communications campaign which has been launched and will continue over the coming years to increase public awareness of the significant health implications of air pollution to encourage behaviour change towards cleaner, more active journeys.

### **We share the air – statutory clean air consultation**

13. On 1<sup>st</sup> July 2019, we launched the statutory consultation on our proposed Clean Air Zone. At its foundation are three online surveys that are tailored to key stakeholders: people that live and work in Sheffield; businesses and organisations; and taxi drivers.
14. This is supported by a dedicated website which provides a short summary of our CAZ proposals, access to the surveys, the OBC and Frequently Asked Questions which we will update as the consultation progresses. The website can be accessed here: <http://www.sheffield.gov.uk/cleanair>
15. The consultation will run for eight weeks, until the 25<sup>th</sup> August 2019, and the comments, ideas and views of all contributors will inform the development of our Final Business Case (FBC) which must be submitted to Government in the autumn. We are intending to ask an independent research organisation to analyse the consultation data and reports will be published along with consultation is a critical part of CAZ proposals to ensure that we tackle harmful pollution, achieve our legal objectives, but do so in a way which works for the people and businesses in Sheffield.
16. The online surveys are a useful way to enable a large number of people and organisations in the city and beyond to have their say. But, to enhance the consultation, we are also planning a series of engagement events over the coming weeks, particularly targeted at those in the city that are most directly affected by the CAZ – businesses and taxi drivers. These events will add depth to the consultation, working directly with businesses and taxi drivers to talk about what the CAZ will mean for them and consider how we can best use the money that we receive from Government to upgrade vehicle fleets. We will publish more details about these engagement events in the coming weeks on the Clean Air website.



17. We are also engaging with a range of stakeholder networks over the consultation period, including Sheffield City Partnership, Sheffield's Health and Wellbeing Board, Sheffield Teaching Hospitals, and Sheffield Chamber of Commerce.

### **Next steps**

18. The coming months will be focused on enabling as many people and businesses as possible to have their say through the Clean Air Zone consultation. We will also continue to develop the business case and implementation plans, working with people living and working in the city, along with colleagues in Rotherham MBC and Government through JAQU.

### **Potential areas for discussion**

19. We would value any contributions, questions and comments from the Economic and Environmental Wellbeing Committee and we will capture these as part of the consultation and the development of the Final Business Case.
20. In particular, we would welcome any views on:
  - How the CAZ proposals have been received by citizens and communities across the city
  - The Outline Business Case as a whole
  - The proposed geography of the Clean Air Zone – ie. the area in which charging will be introduced
  - The consultation, including anything we could do to support more citizens to have a say
  - The draft support packages which we are looking to introduce to support businesses and drivers.

### **Recommendation**

21. That the Committee:
  - a. consider the issues set out in the paper and in the section above; and
  - b. consider developing a formal response to the Clean Air Zone consultation which can then be published and considered in the Final Business Case.