
Case Number	20/00493/FUL (Formerly PP-08479926)
Application Type	Full Planning Application
Proposal	Demolition of dwellinghouse and garages, erection of four dwellinghouses with garages, associated landscaping and formation of access points
Location	69 Whirlow Lane Sheffield S11 9QF
Date Received	10/02/2020
Team	South
Applicant/Agent	Peak Architects - Mr Paul Holden
Recommendation	Grant Conditionally

Time limit for Commencement of Development

1. The development shall be begun not later than the expiration of three years from the date of this decision.

Reason: In order to comply with the requirements of the Town and Country Planning Act.

Approved/Refused Plan(s)

2. The development must be carried out in complete accordance with the following approved documents:

PA-PL-001 Site Location Plan
PA-PL-002 Existing Site Plan/Section
PA-PL-102 Rev. A Proposed Site Layout Plan
PA-PL-201. Proposed Context Elevations
PA-PL-160 Proposed Elevations House Type 1
PA-PL-150 Ground Floor and First Floor Plans House Type 1
PA-PL-151 Second Floor and Roof Plans House Type 1
PA-PL-160 Proposed Elevations House Type 2
PA-PL-150 Basement Plan House Type 2
PA-PL-151 Ground and First Floor Plans House Type 2
PA-PL-152 Second Floor and Roof Plan House Type 2
PA-PL-160 Proposed Elevations House Type 3
PA-PL-161 Proposed Elevations House Type 3

PA-PL-150 Ground Floor and First Floor Plans House Type 3
PA-PL-151 Second Floor and Roof Plan House Type 3

Reason: In order to define the permission.

Pre Commencement Condition(s) – ('true conditions precedent' – see notes for definition)

3. No development shall commence until full details of measures to protect the existing trees to be retained, have been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority and the approved measures have thereafter been implemented. These measures shall include a construction methodology statement and plan showing accurate root protection areas and the location and details of protective fencing and signs. Protection of trees shall be in accordance with BS 5837, 2012 (or its replacement) and the protected areas shall not be disturbed, compacted or used for any type of storage or fire, nor shall the retained trees, shrubs or hedge be damaged in any way. The Local Planning Authority shall be notified in writing when the protection measures are in place and the protection shall not be removed until the completion of the development.

Reason: In the interests of protecting the identified trees on site. It is essential that this condition is complied with before any other works on site commence given that damage to trees is irreversible.

4. No development shall commence until details of the site accommodation including an area for delivery/service vehicles to load and unload, for the parking of associated site vehicles and for the storage of materials, has been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. Thereafter, such areas shall be provided to the satisfaction of the Local Planning Authority and retained for the period of construction or until written consent for the removal of the site compound is obtained from the Local Planning Authority.

Reason: In the interests of protecting the free and safe flow of traffic on the public highway, it is essential that this condition is complied with before any works on site commence.

Other Pre-Commencement, Pre-Occupancy and other Stage of Development Condition(s)

5. Before that part of the development is commenced, full details of the proposed external materials shall have been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority.

Reason: In the interests of the visual amenities of the locality.

6. The dwellings hereby approved shall not be used unless the car parking accommodation shown on the approved plans has been provided in accordance with those plans and thereafter such car parking accommodation shall be retained for the sole purpose intended.

Reason: To ensure satisfactory parking provision in the interests of traffic safety and the amenities of the locality it is essential for these works to have been carried out before the use commences.

7. No development shall commence until a report has been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority, identifying how a minimum of 10% of the predicted energy needs of the completed development will be obtained from decentralised and renewable or low carbon energy, or an alternative fabric first approach to offset an equivalent amount of energy. Any agreed renewable or low carbon energy equipment, connection to decentralised or low carbon energy sources, or agreed measures to achieve the alternative fabric first approach, shall have been installed/incorporated before any part of the development is occupied, and a report shall have been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority to demonstrate that the agreed measures have been installed/incorporated prior to occupation. Thereafter the agreed equipment, connection or measures shall be retained in use and maintained for the lifetime of the development.

Reason: In order to ensure that new development makes energy savings in the interests of mitigating the effects of climate change and given that such works could be one of the first elements of site infrastructure that must be installed it is essential that this condition is complied with before the development commences.

8. A comprehensive and detailed hard and soft landscape scheme for the site shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority before any above ground works commence, or within an alternative timeframe to be agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority.

Reason: In the interests of the visual amenities of the locality.

9. The approved landscape works shall be implemented prior to the development being brought into use or within an alternative timescale to be first approved by the Local Planning Authority. Thereafter the landscaped areas shall be retained and they shall be cultivated and maintained for a period of 5 years from the date of implementation and any plant failures within that 5 year period shall be replaced.

Reason: In the interests of the visual amenities of the locality.

10. No demolition and/or construction works shall be carried out unless equipment is provided for the effective cleaning of the wheels and bodies of vehicles leaving the site so as to prevent the depositing of mud and waste on the

highway. Full details of the proposed cleaning equipment shall be approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority before it is installed.

Reason: In the interests of protecting the free and safe flow of traffic on the public highway, it is essential that this condition is complied with before any works on site commence.

11. Details of a suitable means of site boundary treatment shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority before any above ground works commence, or within an alternative timeframe to be agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority and the dwellings shall not be used unless such means of site boundary treatment has been provided in accordance with the approved details and thereafter such means of site enclosure shall be retained.

Reason: In the interests of the visual amenities of the locality.

12. Large scale details, including materials and finishes, at a minimum of 1:20; of the items listed below shall be approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority before that part of the development commences:

Windows
Window reveals
Doors

Thereafter, the works shall be carried out in accordance with the approved details.

Reason: In order to ensure an appropriate quality of development.

13. The dwellings shall not be occupied unless the hardstanding areas of the site are constructed of permeable/porous materials or drain to permeable areas within the curtilages of the dwellings. Thereafter all approved permeable/porous surfacing material shall be retained.

Reason: In order to control surface water run off from the site and mitigate against the risk of flooding.

14. Unless otherwise approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority, there shall be no piped discharge of surface water from the development prior to the completion of the approved surface water drainage works and no building shall be occupied prior to the completion of the approved foul drainage works.

Reason: To ensure satisfactory drainage arrangements.

15. Unless otherwise approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority, the development shall not be commenced until such time as a scheme to dispose of foul and surface water drainage, including any balancing works and off site works, has been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning

Authority. This development shall be implemented in accordance with this scheme thereafter.

Reason: To ensure satisfactory drainage arrangements.

Other Compliance Conditions

16. Surface water and foul drainage shall drain to separate systems.

Reason: To ensure satisfactory drainage arrangements.

17. The Local Planning Authority shall be notified in writing when the landscape works are completed.

Reason: To ensure that the Local Planning Authority can confirm when the maintenance periods specified in associated conditions/condition have commenced.

18. All first floor side elevation windows, other than bathrooms, in each dwelling shall be non-opening and fully obscured to a minimum privacy standard of Level 4 Obscurity and so retained thereafter. Bathroom windows shall be fixed and obscure glazed up to 1.7 metres above internal floor level. All such arrangements shall be retained thereafter

Reason: In the interests of the amenities of occupiers of adjoining property.

19. Unless otherwise indicated on the approved plans no tree, shrub or hedge shall be removed or pruned without the prior written approval of the Local Planning Authority.

Reason: In the interests of the visual amenities of the locality.

20. The flat roof areas of the dwellings hereby permitted shall not be used as balconies, roof garden or similar amenity area.

Reason: In the interests of the amenities of occupiers of adjoining properties.

21. Notwithstanding the provisions of the Town and Country Planning (General Permitted Development) (Amendment) (England) Order 2015, Schedule 2, Part 1 (Classes A to H inclusive), Part 2 (Class A), or any Order revoking or re-enacting that Order, no extensions, porches, garages, ancillary curtilage buildings, swimming pools, enclosures, fences, walls or alterations which materially affect the external appearance of the dwellings shall be constructed without prior planning permission being obtained from the Local Planning Authority.

Reason: In the interests of the amenities of occupiers of adjoining property, bearing in mind the dwellings relationships to each other and existing neighbouring dwellings

Attention is Drawn to the Following Directives:

1. The Local Planning Authority has dealt with the planning application in a positive and proactive manner and sought solutions to problems where necessary in accordance with the requirements of the National Planning Policy Framework.
2. By law, this development requires the allocation of official, registered address(es) by the Council's Street Naming and Numbering Officer. Please refer to the Street Naming and Numbering Guidelines on the Council website here:

<https://www.sheffield.gov.uk/content/sheffield/home/roads-pavements/address-management.html>

The guidance document on the website includes details of how to apply, and what information we require. For further help and advice please ring 0114 2736127 or email snn@sheffield.gov.uk

Please be aware that failure to apply for addresses at the commencement of the works will result in the refusal of statutory undertakers to lay/connect services, delays in finding the premises in the event of an emergency and legal difficulties when selling or letting the properties.

3. It is noted that your planning application involves the construction or alteration of an access crossing to a highway maintained at public expense.

This planning permission DOES NOT automatically permit the layout or construction of the access crossing in question, this being a matter which is covered by Section 184 of the Highways Act 1980. You should apply for permission, quoting your planning permission reference number, by contacting:

Ms D Jones
Highways Development Management
Highways Maintenance Division
Howden House, 1 Union Street
Sheffield
S1 2SH

Tel: (0114) 273 6136
Email: dawn.jones@sheffield.gov.uk

4. You are required as part of this development, to carry out works within the public highway: as part of the requirements of the New Roads and Street

Works Act 1991 (Section 54), 3rd edition of the Code of Practice 2007, you must give at least three months written notice to the Council, informing us of the date and extent of works you propose to undertake.

The notice should be sent to:-

Highway Co-Ordination
Sheffield City Council
Town Hall
Sheffield
S1 2HH

Telephone: 0114 273 6677

Email: highways@sheffield.gov.uk

Please note failure to give the appropriate notice may lead to a fixed penalty notice being issued and any works on the highway being suspended.

Where the notice is required as part of S278 or S38 works, the notice will be submitted by Highways Development Management.

5. You are advised that this development is liable for the Community Infrastructure Levy (CIL) charge. A liability notice will be sent to you shortly informing you of the CIL charge payable and the next steps in the process.

Please note: You must not start work until you have submitted and had acknowledged a CIL Form 6: Commencement Notice. Failure to do this will result in surcharges and penalties.

6. The applicant is advised that noise and vibration from demolition and construction sites can be controlled by Sheffield City Council under Section 60 of the Control of Pollution Act 1974. As a general rule, where residential occupiers are likely to be affected, it is expected that noisy works of demolition and construction will be carried out during normal working hours, i.e. 0730 to 1800 hours Monday to Friday, and 0800 to 1300 hours on Saturdays with no working on Sundays or Public Holidays. Further advice, including a copy of the Council's Code of Practice for Minimising Nuisance from Construction and Demolition Sites is available from Environmental Protection Service, 5th Floor (North), Howden House, 1 Union Street, Sheffield, S1 2SH: Tel. (0114) 2734651, or by email at epsadmin@sheffield.gov.uk.

Site Location



© Crown copyright and database rights 2016 Ordnance Survey 10018816

LOCATION AND PROPOSAL

This application relates to a domestic dwelling and its curtilage located on Whirlow Lane. The site covers approximately 0.3 ha. The site currently features a large detached stone built dwelling set within a very substantial curtilage. A large area of hardstanding is located to the front of the house offering generous off street car parking and a detached garage is located on the eastern boundary of the site close by No. 59 Whirlow Lane. The site slopes gently from west to east.

The area is wholly residential; predominantly consisting of detached housing though these vary significantly in both architectural style and use of external materials. The application seeks full planning permission to demolish the existing house and build four detached dwellinghouses within the site. All four houses would have a dedicated street frontage, feature off street car parking and have gardens to front and rear.

The dwellings will all be accessed from Whirlow Lane.

RELEVANT PLANNING HISTORY (Post adoption of the UDP in 1998)

There is no relevant planning history

REPRESENTATIONS

Original Submission

23 letters of objection were received in response to the initial neighbour notification scheme including one from Cllr Colin Ross.

Cllr Ross comments as follows:

- The plans are misleading with regard to the actual footprints;
- The proposal is an over-development;
- There will be a loss of privacy to neighbours;
- The dwellings are tall and crowded and present a 'block' appearance;
- The proposal is out of character with the surrounding area;
- There are highway safety concerns regarding Whirlow Lane arising from insufficient parking.

Summary of other objections:-

- Over-development;
- Out of character;
- Facing materials are inappropriate;
- Detract from the nearby Conservation Area;
- Increase traffic on a busy narrow lane;
- design of houses is too regular/similar;
- will endanger pedestrians as no footpath in places on Whirlow Lane;
- inadequate parking provision;
- houses are too high and would be overbearing on neighbouring property (No. 59 Whirlow Lane);

- the house closest to No. 59 Whirlow Lane will cause loss of sunlight and adversely impact on residential amenity;
- the two chimneys per property are very unattractive;
- the house adjacent No. 59 projects too far beyond the rear elevation of that dwelling taking light from westerly facing rooms;
- the dwellings and parking are too close to Whirlow Lane detracting from the character of the street;
- design is too modern for the street scene;
- drive space is too limited and would cause on-street parking to the detriment of highway safety;
- each house will have a small garden and this will add to surface water run-off issues already present on the Lane;
- Construction traffic will cause highway difficulties;
- amount of flat roof is not in character with the street scene;
- bronze cladding is inappropriate;
- the existing house does not follow the established building line contrary to the planning statement;
- the plot is not significantly larger than others on Whirlow Lane contrary to the planning statement;
- the density of the scheme is not consistent with the wider area;
- the proposal might overlook the boundary of No. 77 Whirlow Lane;
- if approved conditions should be added controlling construction hours and construction traffic particularly in relation to school children walking in the Lane;
- there appears to be no protection for trees and shrubs;
- will result in an increased demand for primary and secondary school places in an already oversubscribed catchment and a S106 levy should be sought.

Amended Submission

Cllr Ross has also commented on the amended plans stating that he still objects on the basis of:

- remains an over-development;
- remains out of character;
- loss of stone boundary wall;
- use of grey brick.

Cllr Ross urges that members make a site visit

A further 14 representations have been received in response to the amended plans (9 being from previous objectors).

Summary of points raised:-

- whilst the distance between the middle properties is wider at the front it remains about the same as original at the rear;
- the chimneys are now more prominent;
- the undercroft looks very tight for manoeuvring vehicles into and out of probably rendering the garages useless;

- the introduction of the extra planting to the front of the properties makes the parking arrangements tight leading to only two off-street spaces per house;
- Application 96/00045/OUT (permission for an additional house on the plot of No.77 Whirlow Lane) was refused on the grounds of over-development so granting permission here would be inconsistent with that decision;
- highway safety concerns remain;
- still an over-development of the site;
- still out of character;
- design would be better suited in downtown Los Angeles;
- existing house should not be demolished;
- grey brick is an inappropriate facing material;
- the ridge height facing No.59 remains unacceptably high;
- there is too little separation between the end gable wall of No. 59 and the nearest new house;
- there are windows in the west gable of No. 59 that will be robbed of light and the new house will be overbearing;
- the single storey rear element of the new house closest to No. 59 will still affect visual amenity;
- the ground floor terraces present a potential overlooking towards No. 59 Whirlow Lane;
- the flat roofs of the ground floor garden rooms should not be used as balconies;
- the loss of sections of the front boundary wall would adversely impact the character of the Lane;
- there is still insufficient off street car parking included in the scheme;
- the windows facing No. 77 Whirlow Lane should be obscure glazed;
- the amendments are superficial and do not address concerns.

Matters raised that are not material planning considerations

- would affect private views;
- would impact on local gas supply pressures.

PLANNING ASSESSMENT

The National Planning Policy Framework

The key consideration to be taken from the NPPF is a 'presumption in favour of sustainable development'. The document summarises delivering sustainable development as planning for prosperity (economic role), for people (social role), and for places (environmental role).

Paragraph 11 states that decisions should apply a presumption in favour of sustainable development which for decision making means:-

- c) approving developments that accord with an up to date development plan without delay; and
- d) where there are no relevant development plan policies, or the policies which are most important for determining the application are out of date, granting permission unless.. ii) any adverse impacts of doing so would significantly and demonstrably

outweigh the benefits when assessed against the policies in the framework as a whole.

Specifically with regard to Housing, the NPPF confirms the Government's key objective as being to increase significantly the delivery of new homes. The housing delivery should include increasing the supply of housing; delivering a wide choice of high quality homes and opportunities for home ownership; and creating sustainable, inclusive and mixed communities.

In addition, the NPPF attaches great importance to the design of the built environment. It seeks to ensure planning decisions optimise site potential to accommodate development, whilst responding to local character and the identity of local surroundings.

Local Policy

The site lies within a Housing Area as designated in the adopted Unitary Development Plan (UDP).

The most relevant UDP policies to be referred to in considering the merits of the application are:

- BE5 (Building Design and Siting)
- BE9 (Design for Vehicles)
- H10 (Development in Housing Areas)
- H14 (Conditions on Development in Housing Areas)

Relevant Core Strategy Policies are:

- CS22 Scale of the Requirement for New Housing
- CS23 Locations for New Housing
- CS24 Maximising the Use of Previously Developed Land for New Housing
- CS26 Efficient Use of Housing Land and Accessibility
- CS74 Design Principles

Principle of Development

Land Use and Housing Supply

The site is in an allocated Housing Area as defined in the adopted UDP. Policy H10 (Conditions on Development in Housing Areas) identifies housing (use class C3) as the preferred use of land in the policy area. As such the principle of the redevelopment of this site for housing purposes is considered to accord with policy H10. Policy H10 therefore promotes new homes as the priority use in housing areas across the city, which facilitates housing delivery and is consistent with paragraphs 59 and 67 of the NPPF.

Policy CS22 - Scale for the Requirement for New Housing of the Sheffield Development Framework Core Strategy (CS), sets out Sheffield's housing targets until 2026. The NPPF 2019 provides more up to date guidance on this matter and

requires local authorities to identify a 5 year supply of specific 'deliverable' sites for housing.

Policy CS22 is only partly in conformity with the NPPF. As the Core Strategy is now more than 5 years old, the NPPF states that the housing requirement must be based on the local housing need figure using the Government's standard methodology. As at April 2019 this was 2,124 homes per year (699 homes per year higher than the figure in Policy CS22). The majority of CS22 therefore carries very limited weight. However, the policy states that a 5-year supply of deliverable sites will be maintained at all times, and the most recent published monitoring data (February 2020) concludes that there is 5.1 year supply. This part of the policy is in conformity with the NPPF.

In relation to paragraph 11 of the NPPF, as Sheffield can demonstrate a five year housing supply the most important policies in the determination of this application are not automatically considered to be out of date. The most important local policies in the determination of this application, which in this case revolve around housing land supply, design, highway related impacts, sustainability, amenity, ecology and landscape impacts, do, when considered as a collection, align with the Framework. As such section d) of paragraph 11 is not applied in this instance.'

Nonetheless, this development of 4 dwellings will make a small but positive contribution towards the Councils housing land supply of deliverable sites and this should be afforded appropriate weight as a material consideration.

Paragraph 68 of the revised NPPF sets out that 'Small and medium sized sites can make an important contribution to meeting the housing requirement of an area, and are often built-out relatively quickly. To promote the development of a good mix of sites local planning authorities should... support the development of windfall sites through their policies and decisions – giving great weight to the benefits of using suitable sites within existing settlements for homes'.

The proposal therefore accords with Core Strategy Policy CS23 (Locations for Housing Development) as this is considered to be suitable and sustainable site which is located in the existing urban envelope.

The NPPF (paragraph 118) gives substantial weight to using brownfield land within settlements to meet the needs for new homes, which is consistent with the broad approach of Policy CS23. The policy guides provision of new homes primarily to land within the main urban area of Sheffield which is consistent with both paragraph 118 and the Government's ambition of significantly boosting the supply of housing (at paragraph 59).

Sustainable Use of Land

The application site is a previously developed site for the purposes of national planning guidance relative to housing.

National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF) at paragraph 123 identifies the importance of making sure developments make optimal use of the potential of each

site. Para 123 c) states that local authorities should refuse applications which they consider to do not make efficient use of land, taking into account the policies contained in the NPPF.

Policy CS23 seeks to focus at least 90% of new dwellings in the main urban area and Policy CS24 gives priority to previously developed sites. The proposals are considered in accordance with these policies.

The proposal is located on a greenfield site since the NPPF states that the definition of 'previously developed' excludes land in built-up areas such as residential gardens.

Paragraph 118(c) of the NPPF gives "substantial weight to the value of using suitable brownfield land within settlements for homes", which is consistent with the strong approach taken in Policy CS24, and reflected in the policy target of delivering no more than 12% of new homes on greenfield land. New house building in Sheffield is significantly below the 12% target at closer to 5%.

Greenfield development can be accepted on small sites within the existing urban areas where it can be justified on sustainability grounds as specified in CS 24 (b) or where monitoring shows that there is less than a 5 year supply of deliverable sites – CS24 d).

Given the fine margin currently exhibited in Sheffield's Housing supply (5.1 years) part d) of the policy is considered to have moderate weight.

Whilst residential gardens are excluded from the 'previously developed' definition, it is noted that this development is concentrated towards the front of the site where the existing dwelling, garage block and hard surfacing stands, and the main portion of garden area is retained.

Hence, provided there are not strong policy objections with regard to layout, design, amenity and highways, development of the site would be acceptable with regard to paragraph 118 of the NPPF and also satisfy the objective of significantly boosting the supply of new homes in the city (NPPF paragraph 59).

Policy CS26 specifies density ranges for new housing developments. Subject to protecting the character of an area, at least 30-50 dwellings per hectare are normally expected in Housing Areas such as this.

The proposals represent a density of approximately 13 units per hectare. The proposed density therefore lies outside the specified range parameter specified in the Core Strategy. However, the policy allows for departure from these expectations should the site constraints, or a necessity to more closely follow existing patterns of development/grain/density be significant considerations. As the scheme lies in a lower density urban area a much lower density is considered acceptable and it is considered that an appropriate balance between the requirements of this policy and the prevailing grain of development in the locality is achieved.

The character of the area is discussed in more detail below. However, overall, the area is characterised by two storey residential buildings. The scheme is considered

to reflect the general character of the area and represents an efficient use of land when compared with the current use as a single dwelling. The proposal in this respect is considered to be satisfactory with regards to policy CS26.

Policy CS26 encourages making efficient use of land to deliver new homes at a density appropriate to location depending on relative accessibility. The density requirements are a gradation flowing from highest density in the most accessible locations (NPPF 123(a)) down to lower densities in suburban locations with less accessibility (NPPF 123(b)). The policy is considered consistent with the NPPF.

Demolition

Whilst the existing house is a rather handsome detached dwelling it is neither listed nor located in a Conservation Area. It is not considered to be of such architectural merit that a refusal of permission to demolish could be justified.

Environmental considerations

The NPPF advises at Paragraph 127 that planning policies and decisions should ensure that developments:

- a) Will function well and add to the overall quality of the area, not just for the short term but over the lifetime of the development; and
- b) Are visually attractive as a result of good architecture, layout and appropriate and effective landscaping; and
- c) Are sympathetic to local character and history, including the surrounding built environment and landscape setting, while not preventing or discouraging appropriate innovation or change (such as increased densities); and
- e) Optimise the potential of the site to accommodate and sustain an appropriate amount and mix of development.

Local Plan policies are considered to broadly reflect these priorities and are therefore considered to carry weight.

Grain of Development, Scale and Massing

Policy BE5 of the UDP states that the new buildings should complement the scale, form and architectural style of surrounding buildings and the street scene.

Policy H14 states that new development should be (a) well designed and in scale and character with neighbouring buildings, and (c) not result in the site being over-developed.

Policy CS 74 (Design Principles) within the Core Strategy states that high quality development will be expected, which would respect, take advantage of and enhance the distinctive features of the city, its districts and neighbourhoods.

The locality is exclusively residential and characterised by a variety of two storey houses in generous curtilages. The scale of individual dwellings and their curtilages varies along the length of Whirlow Lane with street frontages for individual dwellings

varying from approximately 10.5 metres up to as much as 50 metres. There is, unsurprisingly, a corresponding range in terms of curtilage size with plots varying between approximately 500 square metres up to the approximately 3,300 square metres that is the development site.

The proposal is for four dwellings. Each would have a street frontage ranging from approximately 12.5 metres up to 14.5 metres and an average plot size in excess of 800 square metres.

In terms of the grain of existing development each house in the proposals would therefore fall somewhere in the mid range in terms of these characteristics.

In respect of scale and massing the proposals are for two storey houses with pitched roofs, both aspects mirroring the prevailing scale in the locality.

The houses would be well set back from the back edge of highway (approximately 20 metres) and this conforms with the general characteristics of the street scene.

The dwelling closest to No. 59 Whirlow Lane is the sole dwelling to feature a garage pushing forward of the nominal building line but this is considered to replicate the existing situation where the garage of the existing No. 69 is located on a very similar footprint, and therefore raises no concerns.

The street scene context elevations indicate a general rising of ridge lines from east to west replicating the rise of the natural ground level and this is considered appropriate. It is not considered the height differential between No. 59 and the easternmost new build will present an anomalous or jarring feature in the street scene.

The houses have been amended so as to provide an increased spacing and to reduce the perception of an overly regimented 'block' that was felt to be out of character in the initial submission. The changes made by the applicant are considered to represent a significant improvement.

Given the above the scheme is considered compatible with the prevailing characteristics of the existing built environment the proposals are considered to satisfy the requirements of policies BE5, H14 and CS74

Design Considerations

Core Strategy policy CS74 'Design Principles' requires development to enhance distinctive features of the area. This is echoed in UDP policies H14 'Conditions on Development in Housing Areas' and BE5 'Building Design and Siting' which require good design in keeping with the scale and character of the surrounding area.

Chapter 12 of the NPPF requires good design, with paragraph 124 stating good design is a key aspect of sustainable development and should contribute positively to making places better for people. Paragraph 130 requires that planning permission should be refused for development of poor design that fails to take opportunities available for improving the character and quality of an area.

In terms of the existing street scene architectural styles also vary somewhat though it would be fair to say that the prevailing character is informed by the Arts and Crafts movement with pitched plain tile roofs, gable features to front elevation and a generous use of bays and small dormers.

The proposed dwellings would have a more contemporary appearance than the majority of houses on Whirlow Lane but it is considered that the amended plans indicate an appearance that is not so far removed from the established grain so that the dwellings would appear especially divergent.

The scheme includes for three distinct house types with the centre two properties being mirror images of each other. This approach is welcomed as this will also reduce any feeling of regimentation throughout the scheme.

Furthermore there is no aspect of national or local policy guidance that stipulates that new buildings should slavishly adhere to existing designs and indeed innovation is actively encouraged in the National Planning Policy Framework.

The extensive use of metal clad box elements, as initially submitted, has now given way to a 'quieter' approach with a more traditional two storey form being employed predominantly in brickwork with expressed bays in cut stone. Whilst the plans refer to the facing brick as a 'grey' colour an example of the type of brick proposed has been presented to officers and this is more of a pale red multi type brick. Vertical timber cladding is proposed to the rear single storey elements of the dwellings but this is restricted to the rear of the properties and is considered appropriate in those locations. A full materials specification can appropriately be secured through a planning condition.

The use of the stone bays and the large windows on front elevation should provide for excellent articulation and also break up the mass of each front elevation. The initially proposed scheme featured large tall and rather overly dominant chimneys to each property. These have subsequently been amended so as to include for a single chimney feature of reduced dimensions on the front elevation of each property. Whilst this is not a feature prevalent on the existing street scene it is considered that the feature combines well with the expressed bays and the overall aesthetic of the design.

The initially submitted scheme featured a very significant area of hardstanding to the front of the houses. This approach resulted from a desire to limit breaks in the existing front boundary wall. However, it was consequently considered that this would introduce an overly 'hard' setting for the proposed houses, an appearance that would be in stark contrast to the generally 'green and leafy' aspect of Whirlow Lane as it exists at present. The amended scheme has therefore introduced significantly larger areas of soft landscaping to the areas forward of the houses and broken the large area of hardstanding previously proposed. This has inevitably led to a necessity to increase the number of vehicular accesses and thereby compromised the wall to a greater degree. Whilst this is unfortunate it is worthy of note that, as this site is not in a Conservation Area, such sections of wall could be removed without the necessity to engage with the planning system. Furthermore it is not considered

that the proposed losses will have a significantly detrimental impact on the street scene.

Given all of the above the built forms and details of the amended scheme are considered compatible with the street scene and it is considered that the scheme will not adversely affect the character of the area. Accordingly, the proposal is considered to be satisfactory with regards to policies BE5, H14 and CS74.

NPPF focuses on achieving well designed places and good design. Policies BE5, H14 and CS74 are consistent with paragraph 127 of the NPPF and are therefore considered to carry significant weight.

Amenity Considerations

Paragraph 127 within the NPPF states that the planning system should always seek to secure a high standard of amenity for existing and future users.

UDP policy H14 'Conditions on Development in Housing Areas' requires that c) the site should not be over-developed or deprive residents of light, privacy or security, or cause serious loss of existing garden space which would harm the character of the neighbourhood.

The guidelines found in the adopted Supplementary Planning Guidance 'Designing House Extensions' are not strictly applicable since they relate to house extensions. However, they provide good guidance relating to overbearing and overshadowing, privacy and overlooking, and appropriate garden sizes. The guidelines state that two storey dwellings which face directly towards each other should be a minimum of 21metres apart. Also, blank elevations to two storey buildings should not be placed closer than 12 metres from a ground floor main habitable window. These guidelines are reflected in the South Yorkshire Residential Design Guide, which, whilst not adopted, is taken as representing best practice in Sheffield.

These policies are therefore considered to align with the requirement of paragraph 127 so should be given significant weight.

Existing Residents

No. 59 Whirlow Lane

The initial submission raised concerns with regard to the potential impacts of masonry walls close to the boundary with this property and projecting well beyond the line of its rear elevation. However the amended scheme now presents a significantly reduced massing in this area. The new build house inset from boundary replicates that of No. 59 and whilst the new build projects beyond the rear elevation of No.59 this projection does not cut a 45 degree line scribed from the nearest ground floor main aspect window in the existing dwelling (in compliance with Supplementary Guidance).

The new build would be located at a higher ground level but given the inset from boundary it is not considered that the side wall of the proposal would significantly impact on the principal rear amenity space of No.59.

There are windows in the gable end (west elevation) of no. 59 but these do not serve main habitable spaces (A study at ground floor, and a bathroom and w.c. at first floor) and are reliant to a degree on the neighbouring land for amenity (light). In this context the protection of light to these windows should be given limited weight.

Houses to the West

The two storey side elevation of the most westerly house in the proposal would achieve at least 16 metres to the nearest dwellings to the west. This is comfortably in excess of the 12 metres required by Supplementary Guidance.

Properties on the opposite side of Whirlow Lane

The proposals would achieve a separation distance in excess of 30 metres and, as such, significantly exceed the 21 metres required by Supplementary Planning Guidance.

Hence, subject to conditions as described it is considered the proposal satisfies the requirements of policies H5 and H14 of the Unitary Development Plan and the relevant paragraph of the NPPF.

Future Occupants

The internal layout of the houses should provide for good outlook and natural lighting to main habitable spaces. The private amenity space provided is very generous and significantly exceeds the requirements of Supplementary Planning Guidance.

It is considered prudent to condition all side elevation windows above ground floor as being obscure and fixed glazed. This is to prevent any overlooking between new builds and overlooking of existing residents.

In view of the above, the proposals are considered to comply with UDP Policy H14 and supporting Supplementary Guidance. Policy H14 and its supporting guidance are considered consistent with paragraph 127 of the NPPF with regard to residential amenity and therefore carry significant weight.

Sustainability Considerations

Renewable Energy

CS65 requires the provision of a minimum of 10% of a development's predicted energy needs to be from decentralised and renewable or low carbon energy. Each dwelling benefits from roof planes that could potentially accommodate solar pv and a large garden which could enable the introduction of ground source heat pumps. Such provision as can be made should be secured by condition.

Policy CS65 is considered consistent with paragraph 153 of the NPPF and is therefore considered to carry substantial weight.

Biodiversity

NPPF paragraph 170 states that developments should contribute to and enhance the natural environment and provide net gains for biodiversity and paragraph 175 d) states that opportunities to incorporate biodiversity improvements should be encouraged in new development.

The scheme retains a significant proportion of the soft landscaped areas of the site and the bank of trees along the southern boundary will be retained. It is considered that the scheme can satisfy the requirements of NPPF paragraphs through the planting of appropriate tree species in the landscape scheme, and as such any landscape scheme should include for native species that provide habitat or food for insects and birds in the locality.

An appropriately detailed soft landscape scheme can address this and should be secured by condition.

Highway Considerations

With regards to inter visibility and general highway safety the existing and proposed vehicular accesses are not considered to represent a highway safety concern as these drives will replicate existing circumstances at properties the length of Whirlow Lane.

Whilst it is accepted that the carriageway on Whirlow Lane is restricted (creating its own form of traffic calming) it is not considered that the net addition of three dwellings will so adversely impact on traffic flows on the road so as to form the basis of a significant highway safety concern.

Car Parking

Policy H14 states that planning permission will be granted for houses only if there would be appropriate off-street car parking for the needs of the people living there.

UDP parking guidelines indicate that provision for a five bedroom dwelling should provide 2-3 off street car parking spaces.

The plans indicate the provision of three spaces per plot. Representations have commented that manoeuvring on site will be constricted but it is not considered that the arrangements for these homes would differ significantly from several other properties on Whirlow Lane where easy manoeuvring within the site (so as to allow access and egress in forward gear) is constrained or, in several existing cases, impossible.

Given the above factors it is considered that the scheme satisfies Policies H14 with regard to parking and highway safety. As previously stated Policy H14 is considered

broadly consistent with the NPPF and the policy can be afforded weight in the consideration of the application.

Landscape Considerations

Policy GE15 'Trees and Woodlands' within the UDP states that trees and woodlands will be protected. This is supported through Policy BE6 'Landscape Design' which seeks in c) to integrate existing landscape features in the development including mature trees and hedges.

The scheme would not result in the loss of any trees of significant public amenity value.

The foliage on the south and west boundaries would be largely retained . The loss of some frontage foliage is required in order to secure vehicular and pedestrian accesses to the dwellings. A condition covering protection measures for the retained trees is recommended to be added to any approval.

Should permission be granted a detailed hard and soft landscape scheme should be required by condition, principally to ensure that the landscaped areas to the front of the houses are appropriately planted and retained.

The specification of boundary treatments both between new build dwellings and the existing neighbouring curtilages should also be sought by condition

The NPPF more strategic with regard to habitats, their protection, enhancement, and biodiversity net gain. However, the strategic aims of protecting trees and woodland of public amenity value is considered consistent with Policy GE15.

Flood Risk

The site lies within Flood Zone 1 and therefore there are no concerns arising from flood risk.

Drainage

Core Strategy policy CS67 'Flood Risk Management' of the Core Strategy states that the extent and impact of flooding should be reduced.

The site is too small to require for a 30% reduction in surface water run-off (as specified in Policy CS67). Large areas of soft landscaping will be retained and all proposed hard surfaces should be required by condition to be permeable/porous materials or drain to permeable areas within the site which will reflect the aims of this policy.

Connection to the public sewer would be considered acceptable. In order to ensure that the scheme doesn't lead to excessive surface water discharge, it will be necessary to include a condition requiring a reduction below existing peak flows to be secured.

Further details regarding foul sewage would need to be covered by condition and Yorkshire Water would be consulted at that stage for comment.

The main focus in NPPF is on a more strategic level than local policy but the details in CS67 conform with the five criteria in paragraph 163 and as such the policy can be afforded weight in the consideration of the application.

Response to Representations

Matters relating to design, residential amenity, highways, and landscape have been dealt with in the main body of this report.

Local gas supply pressures are not a material planning consideration.

A contribution to the provision of local infrastructure is required via the Community Infrastructure Levy.

The development was publicised in accordance with the Council's Statement of Community Involvement.

Community Infrastructure Levy

The Council has adopted a Community Infrastructure Levy (CIL) to provide infrastructure to support new development. Mostly CIL replaces some previous payments negotiated individually as planning obligations, such as contributions towards the enhancement and provision of open space (UDP Policy H16) and towards education provision (Core Strategy Policy CS43).

In this instance the proposal is liable for CIL charges in Zone 5, at a rate of £80 per square metre plus an additional charge associated with the national All-in Tender Price Index for the calendar year in which planning permission is granted, in accordance with Schedule 1 of the Community Infrastructure Levy Regulations 2010.

SUMMARY AND RECOMMENDATION

The proposal seeks permission to develop 4 dwellings on a previously developed site. The provision of these units would be a helpful contribution to Sheffield's housing land supply and would contribute to the housing stock in the area. The principle of the development therefore fully complies with UDP and Core Strategy policies H10, CS24 and CS26.

Furthermore, given the emphasis established in national policy for diverse, high quality residential developments, the scheme is considered to fall within the overarching aims of the National Planning Policy Framework. The NPPF's presumption in favour of sustainable development supports the scheme.

The units are considered to be of an acceptable design which would not adversely impact on the character of the area. The overall architectural approach is considered acceptable and in terms of scale and massing the proposals are considered compatible with the locality.

The houses are set within generous curtilages, the amenities afforded to the future occupants are considered to be of a satisfactory standard and the scheme should not significantly impact on the amenities of existing residents

The vehicle access arrangements and the proposed off-street parking provision are satisfactory.

Taking all of the above and taking into consideration it is therefore felt that, the scheme meets the relevant requirements of the NPPF and UDP policies BE5, BE6, BE9, GE15, and H14, Core Strategy policies CS23, CS24, CS26, and CS74, and the quoted paragraphs of the National Planning Policy Framework.

Accordingly, it is recommended that the application is granted with conditions.

This page is intentionally left blank