



Report to Policy Committee

Author/Lead Officer of Report: Rebecca Nixon,
Capital Delivery Service

Tel: 0114 27 35628

Report of: *Ajman Ali, Executive Director of Neighbourhoods*

Report to: *Charity Trustee Sub-Committee*

Date of Decision: *4th March 2024*

Subject: *Rose Garden Café Progress Update, Graves Park*

Type of Equality Impact Assessment (EIA) undertaken	Initial <input type="checkbox"/>	Full <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
EIA reference number: 2368		
Has appropriate consultation/engagement taken place?	Yes <input type="checkbox"/>	No <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
Has a Climate Impact Assessment (CIA) been undertaken?	Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	No <input type="checkbox"/>
Does the report contain confidential or exempt information?	Yes <input type="checkbox"/>	No <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>

Purpose of Report:

To provide an update on the progress made by officers and the Rose Garden Café Partnership on the following recommendations approved by the Charity Trustee Sub-Committee on October 18th 2023:

1. The proposal for Sheffield City Council, in partnership with stakeholders, to develop a strategy for the restoration of the Rose Garden Café building (options 2A and 2B), pausing work on a replacement building approach (design options 3 and 4) and a limited works approach (design options 1 and 5).
2. That the Rose Garden Café Partnership, once established, creates an action plan to develop the strategy for restoration, which will include defining the following:
 - A framework for a proportionate public consultation on the Rose Garden Café.
 - Establish funding sources to meet the structural remediation and building refurbishment works.
 - Agree a strategy for public communication.

and then proceeding to carry out the agreed consultation and implement the agreed public communication strategy in order to inform the strategy for restoration that will be brought back to the Committee in due course.

This is the second progress report provided since October 2023 committee approval and provides an update on progress made from 20 December 2023 to 16 February 2024.

Recommendations:

The Charity Trustee Sub-Committee is asked to:

1. Note the progress made towards the actions agreed in the October 2023 report.
2. Agree to receive a further report following the local elections on progress towards the recommendations agreed in the October 2023 report.
3. Note that further updates and decisions will be taken to the appropriate Committee as required.

Lead Officer to complete:-		
	I have consulted the relevant departments in respect of any relevant implications indicated on the Statutory and Council Policy Checklist, and comments have been incorporated / additional forms completed / EIA completed.	Finance: <i>Jonny McQuillin</i>
		Legal: <i>Tarmina Saville</i>
		Equalities & Consultation: <i>Louise Nunn</i>
		Climate: Consultation at a future date
	<i>Legal, financial/commercial and equalities implications must be included within the report and the name of the officer consulted must be included above.</i>	
2	SLB member who approved submission:	<i>Ajman Ali, Executive Director of Operational Services</i>
3	Committee Chair consulted:	<i>Councillor Ian Auckland</i>
4	I confirm that all necessary approval has been obtained in respect of the implications indicated on the Statutory and Council Policy Checklist and that the report has been approved for submission to the Committee by the SLB member indicated at 2. In addition, any additional forms have been completed and signed off as required at 1.	
	Lead Officer Name: <i>Rebecca Nixon</i>	Job Title: <i>Project Manager, Capital Delivery Service</i>
	Date: <i>22nd February 2024</i>	

1. PROPOSAL

Background

Sections 1.1 and 1.2 are as per the previous progress update provided on [22 January 2024](#) and are only included for completeness.

1.1 Project timeline summary

In Spring 2022, Sheffield City Council developed a brief for the enhancement of the café provision in Graves Park under the 'Better Parks' programme. The initial Commissioning Brief and Fee Proposal set the following project objectives:

Objective 1 - 'improve facilities for the city'.

Objective 2 - 'maximise revenue for each facility'.

An initial site visit by the design team in May 2022 identified structural and safety concerns and the café was temporarily closed on the 27 July 2022. Propping of the building through significant internal and external scaffolding was installed to mitigate any risk of structural failure and the café reopened w/c 19 December 2022 with reduced seating capacity.

Following Charity Sub-Committee approval in October 2022, a feasibility study was commissioned with the following aims:

- To understand the condition of the existing building and level of repair and refurbishment works required.
- To understand the various options for the café building (restoration, refurbishment, replacement) providing initial costs and scope of works for each option.
- To provide options that respond to the Better Parks Brief and meet the level of service noted in the Better Parks vision statement.

The feasibility report presented design options 1 – 5 with associated feasibility cost estimates based on the commissioned surveys, summarised in the table below.

Approach	Design Option	Proposed Works	Cost Estimate
Existing building restored	2A	Structural stabilisation of the existing building and full refurbishment	£1,790,000
	2B	Structural stabilisation of the existing building with light touch refurbishment to café interiors only	£911,000
Existing building replaced	3	Demolition of the existing building and provision of Modern Methods of Construction facility	£1,480,000
	4	Demolition of the existing building and provision of a traditional build facility	£1,560,000

Limited works	1	Site safely secured and café building closed	£95,000
	5	Demolition of the existing building and site clearance only	£137,000

The options were further appraised to understand viability and how each of the options met the charity objectives. Many factors were considered including community value, funding sources and delivery options. The appraisal highlighted that some of the design options were either unviable (primarily due to funding limitations or delivery challenges) or did not meet the project objectives. Therefore, the October 2023 committee report recommended that the options with a limited works or replacement building approach be paused and a restoration approach pursued. See section 1.3 for the full recommendations approved by Committee. Please also refer to the Charity Trustee Sub-Committee reports dated [25 October 2022](#) and [18 October 2023](#) for further project context.

1.2 Approved recommendations

The following recommendations were approved by the Charity Trustee Sub-Committee on October 18th 2023;

1. The proposal for Sheffield City Council, in partnership with stakeholders, to develop a strategy for the restoration of the Rose Garden Café building (options 2A and 2B), pausing work on a replacement building approach (design options 3 and 4) and a limited works approach (design options 1 and 5).
2. That the Rose Garden Café Partnership, once established, creates an action plan to develop the strategy for restoration, which will include defining the following:
 - A framework for a proportionate public consultation on the Rose Garden Café.
 - Establish funding sources to meet the structural remediation and building refurbishment works.
 - Agree a strategy for public communication.

Progress update

The following sections 1.3 – 1.7 are an update from council officers working with representatives of the Rose Garden Café Partnership (Friends of Graves Park, Save the Rose Garden Café Campaign and Sheffield City Council) of the progress made towards the approved recommendations from 20 December 2023 to 16 February 2024. Please see the previous committee report ([22 January 2024](#)) for the progress update provided from 18 October 2023 to 20 December 2023.

1.3 **Establishing the Rose Garden Café Partnership**

Please see previous committee report for background information.

1.3.1 Chair appointment

The Partnership received three expressions of interest for the role of chair and one application. The application was reviewed by the Partnership using the agreed process including criteria for shortlisting. The applicant met the criteria for shortlisting and was invited to meet the partnership on January 12th. The meeting confirmed that the applicant met the eligibility requirements set out in the advert. In the meeting the applicant asked if remuneration could be provided for the role.

In the first Partnership workshop SCC committed to providing reasonable remuneration for a chair if required and it was later agreed by the partnership that the role would firstly be advertised as voluntary. Following the clarification from the only applicant, it was agreed that reasonable and evidenced out of pocket expenses could be provided. To ensure fairness to all potential applicants, the offer of remuneration was clarified within the chair application pack (via the [SCC Rose Garden Café page](#)) and the chair application deadline extended for a further two weeks to 6 February. No further applications were received, and the partners have therefore offered the position to the applicant, Chris Hallam who will be joining the next Partnership meeting on 1st of March.

1.3.2 Terms of Reference

The partners are currently drafting the Terms of Reference for the Rose Garden Café Partnership which will supersede the Memorandum of Understanding.

1.3.3 The role of the Partnership

When considering the funding and delivery route for the restoration and refurbishment of the café (please see section 1.5), the partners discussed and agreed the role of the partnership. It has been agreed that the Partnership is not a legal entity and will act as an advisory body to SCC. SCC remain the accountable body for the Rose Garden Café and the delivery of the restoration and refurbishment. Within the Partnership decisions are arrived at collectively between the parties, and recommendations made to SCC. The Terms of Reference which are currently being drafted will set out this decision-making process. The role of the Partnership is to develop the project strategy, contributing and securing skills, resources, and funds, and to hold SCC accountable for the successful delivery of the project. The Partnership looked towards similar groups including the Sheffield Street Tree Partnership (STTP) and the General Cemetery Oversight and Advisory Group (GCOAG) who have a similar approach with SCC retaining liability and the groups not legal entities.

1.4 **A framework for a proportionate public consultation on the Rose Garden Café**

1.4.1 Engagement strategy

On February 2nd the Partnership met and discussed the engagement strategy for the restoration and refurbishment of the Rose Garden Café. The

engagement strategy, which is a live document and can be found in the appendix, sets out to do the following.

- Summarise key SCC engagement principles and guidance.
- Provides engagement principles beyond local authority guidance.
- Understand who to engage with and why.
- Understand existing/ongoing engagement and themes to build on.
- Set objectives for engagement.
- Establish what the Partnership are engaging on, why and what people are able to influence.
- Establish how the Partnership will engage – what is the approach and involvement methods?
- Understand draft timeline, resources and budget required to undertake the engagement.
- Provide aspirational examples of engagement.

1.4.2 Consultation proposal

The Partnership are exploring and developing two key consultation methods, a survey and an interactive ideas board in the café, with the aim of ensuring equal opportunities and accessibility to the consultation.

1.4.3 Consultation methods - survey

The survey is currently being developed by the partnership. The survey has three sections – the first set of questions helps to understand if the survey is reaching a diverse demographic representative of the city. The second set of questions looks to understand how the building can better support community and the creation of connections, exploring the types of activities and facilities that can be provided. The third section focusses on understanding the community's prioritisation of design aspirations for the restoration and refurbishment. This section uses design themes adapted from the 'Explore Design: Community Buildings' resource created by the Glass-House Community Led Design and Wright and Wright Architects, on behalf of the Empowering Design Practices research team and can be found [here](#). The current design themes are access, park context and history, interior design, community and enterprise, heritage and identity, maintenance, sustainability and security.

1.4.4 Consultation methods – interactive ideas board in café

The initial proposal is to have interactive boards in the café with key questions and simple cartoons designed by young people for young people. The Partnership is looking to work with a group of young people from a local school to design the boards and the intention for this method is to engage with a broad range of people visiting the café (with a focus on young people) in an interesting and creative way.

1.4.5 Other proposed engagement methods

In the reason for signing petition comments many people shared memories of visiting the café and park. These memories help understand who and how the building is used and could inform future use of the building. It is therefore proposed to have a dedicated page on the Rose Garden Café Have Your Say site for sharing memories, as well as providing a means to do so in the café itself.

1.4.6 Next steps

The Partnership will complete the consultation design and then launch the consultation which will run for a minimum of 4 weeks. The Partnership will then collect the data/feedback, interpret, and collate the information and share with the public. The consultation results will help form the design brief for the restoration and refurbishment of the café and will be shared with the design team once appointed.

1.5 **Establish funding sources to meet the structural remediation and building refurbishment works**

1.5.1 Funding strategy

On February 2nd and February 16th the Partnership met and had a dedicated agenda item to discuss and develop the funding strategy. An initial funding strategy document has been drafted to collate the initial cost plan estimates, funding sources, external grant funding opportunities and delivery routes. This document is a live document, updated as required and will be shared with the committee at the next progress update.

1.5.2 Essential Compliance and Maintenance Fund

As per previous progress report, it has been agreed that this fund can be used for any essential feasibility, structural design and costing work needed to enable robust external funding bids to be submitted, subject to the funding limits agreed – which is the critical next step in the ultimate goal of the Rose Garden Café reprovision. It is recognised that applications for external grants have requirements which may require further work to be undertaken. The Essential Compliance and Maintenance Fund can only be used for works linked to structural defects and needs to meet the criteria approved at the Strategy and Resources Committee described in section 4.2.2. This fund will be used to pay the structural engineer fee, please see section 1.7 for further details of the structural engineer appointment.

1.5.4 Next steps

The partners will continue to establish and progress funding sources to understand timelines, requirements, and risks for each funding source in parallel to undertaking the consultation. SCC will establish how funds are transferred and managed.

1.6 **Agree a strategy for public communication**

Shared comms

Each meeting the Partnership agrees a shared communication that partners can choose to share via their existing channels. The dedicated Rose Garden Café SCC page is updated with key updates and press releases are published for key milestones. Since October 2023 the following SCC press release has been issued - [‘Steps taken to establish the Rose Garden Café Partnership’](#) The next press release will be to mark the appointment of the chair and note key progress. The Partnership has discussed that there needs to be more ways to regularly update the public on the restoration and refurbishment progress, as

well as having a unified comms and have agreed to have an update board in the café and use the Have Your Say page under construction.

1.7 Appointment of structural engineer to develop structural design

1.7.1 Background

At the initial workshop, a session to discuss the key priorities for the partnership over the coming months was held. One of the priority items highlighted by Friends of Graves Park was to agree the reason for the lean in the front wall. The previous progress report noted that the Partnership had agreed that the next step to progress this item would be the appointment of a structural engineer on the Conservation Accredited Register of Engineers (CARE) or with relevant heritage experience to progress the structural design.

1.7.2 Brief co-created and issued via SCC delivery partner

SCC presented several routes to appointing a structural engineer and it was agreed by the Partnership that the preference was to appoint via SCC's delivery partner, RLB. It was also agreed by the Partnership that the independence of the information provided via this route would not be questioned if the Partnership were a part of co-creating the brief. Therefore, the Partnership co-created a brief for the structural engineer (please see appendix for brief). The purpose of the appointment is to develop a structural design solution for the café which addresses the structural deterioration of the building and where possible, retaining/refurbishing the front façade and existing structure is the preferred solution. The brief was issued to the delivery partner along with all supporting information including surveys, existing drawings (current and historic), Capital Delivery Service reports, propping calcs, FoGP commissioned survey and architectural proposals. Two quotes have been requested to ensure value. The delivery partner has provided an update that two structural engineering firms have confirmed they want to be involved in the project and are now preparing a fee and timeline.

1.7.3 Next steps

Once the fee proposals and timeline are received these will be reviewed and an engineer appointed to undertake the work. The work provided alongside the consultation results will enable the initial cost plan to be finalised and the Partnership can then submit funding applications.

2. HOW DOES THIS DECISION CONTRIBUTE?

2.1 The proposal to pursue a restoration approach in Partnership with stakeholders is still felt to be in the best interests of the Graves Park Charitable Trust for the reasons outlined in the October 2023 Charity Trustee Sub-Committee Report. The learnings from this project will contribute towards the accommodation review of community buildings.

3. HAS THERE BEEN ANY CONSULTATION?

3.1 There has not been any public consultation specifically regarding this report.

3.2 Ongoing Consultation

The Save the Rose Garden Café Campaign and Friends of Graves Park continue to inform and consult their members via their existing channels.

3.3 Proposed Consultation

As per section 1.4, a proportionate public consultation is currently being designed and will be undertaken by the Partnership to provide different ways for the public to engage and participate in the future of the café. The proposed consultation is to build on the themes established in the STRGCC petition and help the Partnership understand community objectives for the Rose Garden Café beyond structural and repair works, whether that be establishing user experiences or highlighting which design aspects of the restoration and refurbishment are most important to park and café users. Consultation will be in accordance with the Equality Act 2010, the Sheffield City Council Involvement Guide and Sheffield City Council Consultation Principles, including that consultation should be proportionate, inclusive and accessible. Consultation will be city wide as Graves Park is a designated destination site. Please see section 1.4 and the appendices for further information.

4. **RISK ANALYSIS AND IMPLICATIONS OF THE DECISION**

4.1 Equality Implications

4.1.1 The initial Equality Impact Assessment conducted for the October 2023 report is being updated to include ongoing considerations for the public consultation. The EIA remains a live document and will be reviewed and updated as required to ensure a full and current picture of the equalities implications of this work.

4.2 Financial and Commercial Implications

4.2.1 There are no new financial or commercial implications in this report.

4.2.2 Essential Compliance and Maintenance Fund

As per the October 2023 committee report, the structural defects of the Rose Garden Café have been assessed and meet the prioritisation criteria set out and approved at the Finance Committee in March 2023 for accessing the fund. For the Rose Garden Café, the fund can be used for financing structural stabilisation works but cannot be used for refurbishment works looking to improve the facility. The amount allocated from the fund for the Rose Garden Café will need to be reviewed alongside other Council assets that meet the criteria. As a restoration approach progresses, the scope and cost of the proposed structural stabilisation works (costed at £635,000 by SCC) will develop in detail and accuracy and this will also inform the amount asked from the fund.

4.3 Legal Implications

4.3.1 As a report updating on progress, there are no direct legal implications from this report.

4.3.2 Memorandum of Understanding

As per the previous report, the partners have co-created and signed a Memorandum of Understanding (MOU). The MOU sets the terms and understanding between key partners; Sheffield City Council, Friends of Graves Park and Save the Rose Garden Café Campaign ahead of the Rose Garden Café Partnership (and associated Terms of Reference) being finalised. It is drafted as a statement of intent as to how the parties will work together and the processes and not to create legal obligations (see 4.3.3). The MOU is to be superseded by the Terms of Reference that are being drafted by the Partnership setting out the commitment, resources, and other considerations that each of the parties will bring.

4.3.3 The Rose Garden Café Partnership

The October 2023 committee report recommended to members that the Council works in partnership with stakeholders to develop a strategy for restoration – referred to in places as the Rose Garden Café Partnership. The intention is that this approach will enable a collaboration of skills, resources and funds. However, it is not intended to form a legal partnership and the Rose Garden Café Partnership will not be a legal entity in its own right. This has been discussed with the partners and it has been agreed that the Partnership will act as an advisory body to SCC, with SCC retaining liability and accountability for the building and delivery of the works. This will be included in the Terms of Reference.

4.4 Climate Implications

There are no direct climate implications arising from this report.

5. ALTERNATIVE OPTIONS CONSIDERED

- 5.1 This report was produced to provide an update on progress made towards the recommendations made in the Rose Garden Café October 18th 2023 report. The only alternative option would have been to not produce an update report in March and wait for the next committee meeting, which was discounted by Officers.